Abandoned ideals of brotherhood?
A masculinity perspective on the relationship between 19th century Norwegian Missionaries and Zulu Pastors

Kristin Fjelde Tjelle
School of Mission and Theology,
University of Stavanger, Norway

Abstract

The Lutheran Norwegian Missionary Society (NMS) sent in 1844 its first missionaries to the Zulus. The NMS' goal was to establish native churches which become self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating. This "three-self" formula was to be accomplished by winning individual souls to Christianity, organising them into churches and providing them with trained, indigenous ministry. Baleni kaNdlela Mthimkhulu was the first Zulu pastor to be ordained in NMS in 1893. The paper asks why it took so long for NMS missionaries to fulfil their original objective of recruiting, educating and ordaining indigenous church personnel. Furthermore, why were the Zulu pastors after ordination still treated as the missionaries' subordinates? The questions are discussed from a masculinity perspective. The paper argues that internal church relations between these groups of men were influenced by external political and societal power relations where white masculinity had hegemony. The Norwegian missionaries' ambivalent understanding of the Zulu man reflected common colonial discourses, where Zulu men on one hand were portrayed as physical strong and well-gifted men with rich potential, on the other hand as unstable, emotional and childish men.

Introduction

The founders of the Norwegian Missionary Society (NMS) in 1842 were ideologically influenced by contemporary international trends in Protestant missions. What came to be known as the "three-self" formula (self-governing, self-supporting and self-propagating churches), popularised, if not envisaged, by Henry Venn, secretary of the Church Missionary Society in Great Britain, and his North American colleague, Rufus Anderson, secretary of the American Board of Commissioners for Foreign Mission, became also the vision of NMS.[1] The NMS goal was to establish native churches, which become self-supporting, self-governing and self-propagating, or self-extending. This "three-self" objective was to be accomplished by winning individual souls to Christianity, organising them into churches, and then providing them with trained, native ministry. The NMS missionary instruction from 1852 stated:

> As the object of mission is to transplant the church of Gospel, the missionary shall, once a few have been baptized, as soon as possible organize a congregation among them according to the apostolic pattern and care for its preservation and growth. For this purpose he shall also seek to train African converts as pastors and national assistants, and he shall encourage the congregation in general … to contribute to its subsistence and propagation.[2]

In his centennial history of the NMS's work among the Zulu in southeast Africa, Olav Guttorm Myklebust asserted that two events were of greatest importance.[3] One was the 1858 baptism of the NMS's first convert, Mathenjwaze kaNondumo Shange, at Umphumulo mission station. The other event was the ordination of the first NMS Zulu pastor, Baleni kaNdlela Mthimkhulu, at Empangeni

---

1 Henry Venn (1796-1873) and Rufus Anderson (1796-1880) arrived at their ideas separately, in spite of the outstanding similarities in the basic outline of the three-self theory. From mid- to late nineteenth century the "three-self"-program were the stated policy of both British and American Protestant missions. See C. Peter Williams, *The ideal of the self-governing church: a study in Victorian missionary strategy* (Leiden: E. J. Brill, 1990); Paul William Harris, *Nothing but Christ. Rufus Anderson and the ideology of Protestant Foreign Missions* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1999).

2 Cited in Torstein Jørgensen, *Contact and Conflict: Norwegian Missionaries, the Zulu Kingdom, and the Gospel: 1850-1873* (Oslo: Solum, 1990), 218. Jørgensen's translation.

3 Olav Guttorm Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika," in *Det Norske Misjonsselskap 1842-1942*, ed. John Nome (Stavanger: Dreyer, 1949), 114.

mission station in 1893. While Shange's baptism has made a definite impression on the NMS's organisational memory,[4] Mthimkhulu's ordination has not received equal attention. To be fair, NMS's first ordination in Zululand after more than forty years of missionary work paled compared to the thirty-four pastors ordained in the NMS's Malagasy mission in the same year. The latter was announced in the NMS's magazine, *Norsk Missionstidende* (NMT), under the heading: "A wonderful ordination." The NMT editor informed Norwegian mission supporters that after a mere twenty-six years of missionary work in Madagascar, already fifty-six Malagasy pastors were in active NMS church service.[5]

It took long for NMS missionaries to the Zulus to fulfil their original objective of recruiting, educating and ordaining indigenous church personnel. It should be noted, however, that other mission societies operating in southeast Africa during this same period were likewise reluctant to ordain indigenous Zulu clergy.[6] Tiyo Soga was the first South African to be ordained (into the Presbyterian Church) and this occurred in Glasgow, Scotland in 1856. In Natal, the Methodists made the first step towards an African clergy by receiving Clement Johns as a minister on trial in 1867. Between 1870 and 1871 five Zulus were ordained by the American Board, with the Anglicans ordaining their first two indigenous priests in 1871. According to the historian Richard Elphick, the Anglicans and Methodists far outpaced the Presbyterians and Congregationalists in ordaining indigenous South African clergy during the nineteenth century.[7] The Lutheran, Moravian, and Dutch Reformed missions, on the other hand, lagged far behind American and British mission societies in terms of the pace of ordaining indigenous clergy. In 1911, the ratio of Western missionaries to ordained Africans was 5.4 to 1 (221 to 41) in British missions; 7.2 to 1 (143 to 20) in American missions; 22.5 to 1 (518 to 23) in Lutheran and Moravian (German and Scandinavian) missions; and 225 to 1 (225 to1) in Dutch Reformed missions.[8] The ordination of indigenous clergy in mission churches encouraged a small group of black professional churchmen to expect equal treatment from their white colleagues. Their expectations, however, were not met, and from the 1890s onward numerous "Ethiopian" separatist churches were founded by African clergy and evangelists, many of whom were the mission societies' most trusted and admired men.[9]

Why did it take so long for NMS missionaries to southeast Africa to fulfil their original objective of recruiting, educating and ordaining indigenous church personnel? And, when eventually Zulu pastors were ordained, why were they still treated as the missionaries' subordinates, underlings? The purpose of this paper is to discuss these questions from a masculinity perspective. The recruitment of Zulu teachers, evangelists and pastors was largely a gendered project, as the future leaders of the Zulu church had to be men, according to nineteenth century theological thinking and practice. The relationship between Norwegian missionaries and Zulu pastors was of men-to-men, and therefore, an analysis of this masculinity relationship could be useful. In this paper I will first analyse NMS missionaries' perceptions of the Zulu male, as it was represented in mission literature. I will then examine the case of Baleni kaNdlela Mthimkhulu's ordination of 1893. Of necessity, however, I must also examine events and processes preceding the dismissal of the very same pastor ten years later. My paper is thus an analysis of constitutions of masculinities on a discursive level, as well as an examination of social practise.

A major debate within the international research field of studies on men and masculinities concerns power relations. The Australian sociologist, Robert W. Connell, developed a theory of masculinity whereby *hegemonic masculinity* referred to a particular form of masculinity dominant in

---

4 In June 2008 the 150th anniversary of this first baptism in the history of NMS was celebrated at the present head office in Stavanger.

5 *Norsk Missionstidende* (*NMT*) 48, no. 16 (1893), 309-311.

6 Norman Etherington, *Preachers, peasants and politics in Southeast Africa, 1835-1880. African Christian communities in Natal, Pondoland and Zululand* (London: Royal Historical Society, 1978), 145-175; Philippe Denis, ed., *The making of an indigenous clergy in Southern Africa. Proceedings of the International Conference held at the University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg, 25-27 October 1994* (Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications, 1995); Philippe Denis, ed., *Orality, Memory and the past: listening to the voices of black clergy under colonialism and apartheid. Papers read at the International Conference held at the University of Natal, Pietermaritzburg on 30 June-3 July 1999* (Pietermaritzburg: Cluster Publications, 2000).

7 Richard Elphick, "Evangelical Missions and Racial 'Equalization'," in *Converting colonialism: visions and realities in mission history, 1706-1914*, ed. Dana L. Robert (Grand Rapids/Cambridge: Wm. B. Eerdmans Publishing Co., 2008), 112-133.

8 Ibid., 130. Elphick bases his calculation on the statistics of the 1911 *World Atlas of Christian Missions*.

9 Ibid. See also Bengt Sundkler, *Bantu prophets in South Africa* (London: Lutterworth Press, 1948); Bengt Sundkler, *Zulu Zion and some Swazi Zionists* (London: Oxford University Press, 1976); Erhard Kamphausen, "Unknown heroes: the founding fathers of the Ethiopian Movement in South Afrika," in Philippe Denis, ed., *The making of an indigenous clergy in Southern Africa,* 83-100*;* Simon Moripe, "Indigenous clergy in the Zion Christian Church," in Ibid., 102-107.

society.[10] Hegemonic masculinity exercises its power over other masculinities; it further regulates male power over women and distributes power differently among men. Connell's theory has influenced recent South African gender research, according to Robert Morrell.[11] The gendered ideas of rival masculinities, claim to power, and finally, the importance of class and race, have appealed to researchers working in regions of complex and mixed gender regimes and identities. In nineteenth-century South African history, a range of masculinities can be identified and defined. The idea of a "patchwork quilt of patriarchies" was introduced by Belinda Bozzoli in 1983, and she suggested a coexistence of many patriarchies in nineteenth-century South Africa.[12] Cherryl Walker found it useful to reduce the various forms of patriarchies to two dominant systems – "the one broadly characteristic of the pre-capitalist Bantu-speaking societies of the region, the other of the colonial states established by the European settlers".[13] Morrell lists three main groups, including: white colonial masculinities (British, Boer, etc.), African rural masculinities, and black (multi-ethnic) urban masculinities.[14] White supremacy in South African history suggests that white, ruling class masculinity was hegemonic, but according to Morrell, colonialism never destroyed traditional African masculinities. Rather, "it continued as a collective gender identity amongst African men, reflecting a pre-colonial past and the gender regimes of those institutions which remained relatively impact". Accelerated urbanisation and industrialisation created an urban proletariat, and a black masculinity, which was homogenous in its opposition to white masculine dominance.

In this paper I claim that in southeast Africa an original and idealistic idea of a Christian brotherhood between Norwegian missionaries and Zulu pastors was abandoned by the NMS. It was replaced by an ideology of a father-son relationship between the white missionary and the black pastor, where the latter was understood as a youth who *not yet* reached the level of manhood. Paternalistic discourses justified a reluctance to distribute church power and influence to a rapidly increasing group of male Zulu church personnel. Such attitudes persisted among NMS missionaries, when in the 1920s they faced processes of independence in the Lutheran Zulu Church, as thoroughly examined by the historian Hanna Mellemsether.[15] The attitude of the NMS, as I mentioned earlier, was not the exception. According to Bengt Sundkler, in his monumental church history of Africa, expectant attitudes towards the independence processes of African churches dominated in most Western mission organisations during the period 1920 to 1960:

> In the Churches the message about Time was largely that it was "not yet". Henry Venn's and Rufus Anderson's programme in the 1850s implied African self-government and eventual "euthanasia" of the missions, but when the question of self-government was brought up in the councils and committees of the Churches, the answer was "Not Yet".[16]

---

[10] Robert William Connell, *Gender and power: society, the person and sexual politics* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1987); Robert William Connell, *Masculinities* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 1995).

[11] Robert Morrell, *Changing men in Southern Africa* (Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press, 2001), 6.

[12] Belinda Bozzoli, "Marxism, feminism and South African Studies," *Journal of Southern African Studies* 9, no. 2 (1983), 139-171

[13] Cherryl Walker, "Women and gender in southern Africa to 1945: An overview," in *Women and gender in Southern Africa to 1945*, ed. Cherryl Walker (Cape Town/London: David Philip/James Currey, 1990), 1-32.

[14] Robert Morrell, "Of boys and men: masculinity and gender in Southern African Studies" *Journal of Southern African Studies* 24, no. 4 (1998): 605-630.

[15] Hanna Mellemsether, "Misjonærer, settlersamfunn og afrikansk opposisjon. Striden om selvstendiggjøring i den norske Zulukirken, Sør-Afrika ca. 1920-1930", dissertation for the degree of Dr. Art., University of Trondheim, 2001.

[16] Bengt Sundkler and Christopher Steed, *A history of the church in Africa* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2000), 620.

The ambivalent understanding of the Zulu man

In her book *Colonial Masculinity,* Mrinalini Sinha describes how English colonists in India during the late nineteenth century largely constructed their masculinity by describing Indians, especially men from the Indian higher classes, as effeminate.[17] With her case study Sinha wanted to demonstrate that notions of English/British and Bengali/Indian masculinities could not be understood "simply from the framework of discrete 'national' cultures; instead they must be understood in relation to one another, and as constitutive of each other".[18] She also wanted to emphasise the significance of imperialism in the construction of the politics of masculinities. As other post-colonial theorists, Sinha relied on Edward Said's groundbreaking text *Orientalism.*[19] The essence of Said's concept of Orientalism is that European imperialism was accompanied by a massive project to reconstruct "knowledge" about the Orient for the exercise of imperial power and that this invention had a generative impact in producing what would later become "the Orient".

My study of NMS missionary texts, with a particular focus on the representations of the Zulu man, reveals that the Norwegian missionaries performed their own "Orientalist enterprise". The NMS was the first missionary society in Norway. A Norwegian audience showed a growing interest in their compatriots' endeavours in southeastern Africa, with mission magazines, books and pamphlets experiencing increased circulation from ther mid-nineteenth century. Several books describing the NMS's mission enterprise among the Zulu were published. In 1865 pastor Halfdan E. Sommerfelt was engaged by the NMS to write a first historical account.[20] Sommerfelt's primary sources were missionaries' reports and letters printed in the NMT. In the descriptions of African geographical, cultural, religious and political conditions, however, he relied on British and German sources, mainly books by missionaries, explorers and military officers.[21] In 1915, Ole Stavem wrote a history of the NMS's seventy years of missionary work among the Zulus, and Olav Guttorm Myklebust wrote the centenary book.[22] Both Stavem and Myklebust had long experience as missionaries, Stavem from 1869 to 1912, and Myklebust from 1931 to 1939. In response to a growing enthusiasm for missions among summer school youth and mission study groups in the first decades of the 20th century, Norwegian Zululand missionaries produced several mission study books.[23]

During the eighty-four year period between Sommerfelt's 1865 book and Myklebust's 1949 book, Norwegian mission literature accounts of Zulu geography, population, history, religion, culture and sociology share surprising similarities. All literature mentioned had a section where "the Zulu" was introduced. *The Zulu* was a gendered idiom, however. In fact, it was *the male Zulu* – the Zulu man – who was discussed. Not only were pronouns like he, him or his used, as in Myklebust's description from 1949: "As an African the Zulu is in many ways the opposite to the European. He is neither a man of will nor a man of thought."[24] Statements like "The Zulus were warriors and despised all kinds of work",[25] or "courage and manliness are the qualities they most admire",[26] seem to imply that the authors had the Zulu man, and not the Zulu woman, in mind. The life condition of Zulu women as "suppressed victims" was frequently portrayed by Norwegian missionaries.[27] Thus, the case of the Norwegian mission goes into a general picture of western missionaries' representations of the

---

17 Mrinalini Sinha, *Colonial masculinity: the 'manly Englishman' and the 'effeminate Bengali' in the late nineteenth century* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press, 1995).

18 Ibid., 7.

19 Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (N.Y.: Pantheon Books, 1978).

20 Halfdan E. Sommerfelt, *Den Norske Zulumission. Et Tilbageblik paa de første 20 Aar af det Norske Missionsselskabs Virksomhed* (Christiania: Wm. Gram, 1865).

21 Sommerfelt refers to Henry H. Methuens' *Life in the wilderness or wanderings in South Africa* from 1846, Robert Moffat's *Missionary labours and scenes in Southern Africa* from 1842 and Captein William Ross King's *Campaining in Kaffirland or scenes and adventures of the Kaffir War of 1851-2* from 1853. He also refers to the German missionary Karl Wilhelm Posselt's articles in *Berliner Missionsbericht.*

22 Ole Stavem, *Et bantufolk og kristendommen: Det norske missionsselskaps syttiaarige zulumission* (Stavanger: Det norske missionsselskaps forlag, 1915); Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika".

23 Hans Kristian Leisegang, *Vor Zulumission* (Stavanger: Det Norske Missionsselskaps forlag, 1921); *Misjonsalbum. Syd-afrika. 109 billeder og et kart fra Det Norske Misjonsselskaps arbeidsmark i Zulu og Natal*, (Stavanger: Det Norske Misjonsselskaps forlag, 1928); Johan Kjelvei, ed., *Zulu. Evangeliets landvinning* (Stavanger: Det Norske Misjonsselskaps trykkeri, 1932).

24 Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika," 17: "Som afrikaner er zulueren på mange måter européerens motsetning. Han er verken viljens eller tankens mann."

25 Stavem, *Et bantufolk og kristendommen: Det norske missionsselskaps syttiaarige zulumission* , s. 42: "Zuluerne var krigere og foragtet alt arbeide."

26 Kjelvei, ed., *Zulu. Evangeliets landvinning* , 43: "Mot og manndighet er egenskaper som de mest beundrer".

27 Hanna Mellemsether, "African women in the Norwegian Mission in South Africa," in *Gender, race and religion: Nordic missions 1860-1940*, ed. Inger Marie Okkenhaug (Uppsala: Swedish Institute of Missionary Research, 2003).

conditions of Zulu women.[28] It also resembles a general tendency in the nineteenth-century international missionary movement where women living in non-Christian societies were understood as repressed victims.[29] But the main discussions about *the Zulu* in the Norwegian mission literature were discussions about the Zulu man, while women's issues were described in separate sections.

How was the Zulu man represented in the NMS literature? He was above all described as healthy, strong, with sturdy physique and an appealing appearance: "The average Zulu is tall and his muscular, well proportioned athletic body is a master-piece in bronze, which only the great Creator could have achieved."[30] In Norwegian mission literature, we actually find an obsession with the physical attributes of "the Zulu race". Writers praised the anatomy and physiques of the "Kaffir race" or "Bantu race" (*Nguni*) in general, and the Zulus in particular. Compared to "the short, sluggish yellow-brown Hottentot", or "the pygmy, bestial Bushmen", Sommerfelt claimed that "the tall, beautiful and stalwart Kaffir", with his "open, manly attitude and free, bold, walk" were on a much higher racial level.[31] Most of the Norwegian writers described the nature and climate of Zululand as extraordinary healthy, something which had influenced the development of the race.[32] Perceptions of the Zulu as superior among the African races continued to flourish in Norwegian mission literature. Myklebust asserted in 1949 that the Zulu owned extraordinary "abilities and possibilities", and not only in a physiological way, but also on a psychological and cultural level, the Zulus "stands out" among Africans.[33]

The Zulu man's inner qualities were also discussed in the Norwegian mission literature. Whereas Stavem spoke of "the national character" of the Zulu people, Myklebust some decades later discussed "the national mentality". Representations were quite ambivalent, however, and it is tempting to cite the post-colonial theorist Homi K. Bhabha when he points to ambivalence as typical for the object of colonial discourse – "that 'otherness' which is at once an object of desire and derision, an articulation of difference contained within the fantasy of origin and identity".[34] Ambivalence was particular evident in the descriptions of the Zulu warrior. Detailed descriptions of the warrior's costume, his spear and shield were given, and illustrations and photos of young Zulu warriors were printed in mission magazines and books.[35] The brave and proud "warrior spirit" of the Zulu man was praised, and his loyalty, dedication and love for his king and nation were admired. At the same time the Zulu warrior was represented as a cruel and bloodthirsty savage. In Norwegian mission literature, as in colonial texts, there were lots of references to King Shaka, his impressive army construction and his conquest of neighbouring tribes.[36] Simultaneously, however, Shaka was portrayed as both a murderer and monster.[37] This ambivalence in Western images of the Zulu warrior does still today, in the 21st century, entertain "a counter-image of the noble, courageous tribal warrior, paradoxically admirable in his very savagery", according to the historian John Laband.[38]

---

[28] Deborah Gaitskell, "Devout domesticity? A century of African women's Christianity in South Africa," in *Women and gender in Southern Africa to 1945*, ed. Cherryl Walker (Cape Town/London: David Philip/James Currey, 1990), 251-272; Heather Hughes, "'A lighthouse for African womanhood': Inanda Seminary, 1869-1945," in Ibid., 197-220; Sheila Meintjes, "Family and gender in the Christian community at Edendale, Natal, in colonial times," in Ibid., 125-145.

[29] See for instance Kumari Jayawardena, *The white woman's other burden: Western women and South Asia during British Colonial rule* (New York: Routledge, 1995); Susan Thorne, "Mission-imperial feminism," in *Gendered missions: women and men in missionary discourse and practice*, ed. Mary Taylor Huber and Nancy Lutkehaus (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1999), 39-65.

[30] Andrew Burgess, *Zulufolket. Evangeliet blant zuluerne* (Oslo: Schreudermisjonens forlag, 1944), 43.

[31] Sommerfelt, *Den Norske Zulumission. Et Tilbageblik paa de første 20 Aar af det Norske Missionsselskabs Virksomhed,* 72: "Hvad enten man ser til de smaa dorske, gulbrune Hottentotter i Kapkolonien eller til de dvergagtige, dyriske Buskmænd oppe ved Snebjergene eller til Betsjuaner og Negre i det Indre, - saa maa de alle staa mer eller mindre langt tilbage for det høje, vakre og virkelig stoute Kafferfolk med den aabne, mandige Holdning og frie, dristige Gang".

[32] Sommerfelt claimed that Zululand was the healthiest region of the world, and that western physicians who tried to establish an enterprise in Zululand became jobless and either had to return or make a living out of farming. Ibid., 69.

[33] Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika," 17: "Zuluerne er en stolt slekt. Men de eier også evner og muligheter som få afrikanske folk. Ikke bare fysisk, men også psykisk og kulturelt raker de høyt".

[34] Homi K. Bhabha, "The other question: the stereotype and colonial discourse," *Screen* 24, no. 4 (1983): 18-36.

[35] Sommerfelt, *Den Norske Zulumission. Et Tilbageblik paa de første 20 Aar af det Norske Missionsselskabs Virksomhed* , 74-75; *NMT* 39, no. 21 (1884), 405-406; *Misjonsalbum. Syd-afrika. 109 billeder og et kart fra Det Norske Misjonsselskaps arbeidsmark i Zulu og Natal*, 7, 9; Kjelvei, ed., *Zulu. Evangeliets landvinning,*14; Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika,"17.

[36] South African historians are currently reinvestigating the historical truth of Shaka and his so called "devastations". See Carolyn Hamilton, *Terrific majesty. the powers of Shaka Zulu and the limits of historical invention* (Cape Town, Johannesburg: David Philip Publishers, 1998): John Wright, "Revisiting the stereotype of Shaka's 'Devastations'," in *Zulu identities: being Zulu, past and present*, ed. Benedict Carton, John Laband, and Jabulani Sithole (Scottsville: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press, 2008), 69-81.

[37] Sommerfelt, *Den Norske Zulumission. Et Tilbageblik paa de første 20 Aar af det Norske Missionsselskabs Virksomhed*, 63: "Det tyranniske Uhyre".

[38] John Laband, "'Bloodstained Grandeur'. Colonial and imperial stereotypes of Zulu Warriors and Zulu warfare," in *Zulu identities: being Zulu, past and present*, ed. Benedict Carton, John Laband, and Jabulani Sithole (Scottsville: University of KwaZulu-Natal Press, 2008), 168.

Stavem saw a relationship between geographical and natural surroundings, and the Zulu national character or *Volkgeist*.[39] The abundant natural conditions such as fertile soil and a warm, healthy climate had never forced the Zulus to work hard to make a good harvest. Neither was there any need of hard efforts to produce clothes for protection against cold weather. As a result, "laziness and idleness" had become essential features in the national character of the Zulu people. Stavem further pointed to the fact that Africans were surrounded by wild animals, and that they had been forced to develop strategies to fight them. This could explain their strong bodies, their "raw power" and "savage courage". He admitted that the well-known "brave warrior spirit" of the Zulu was a good thing, but one should not forget that the same spirit also implied that they acted as "bloodthirsty, cruel, robbery desirous and sly warriors". Stavem concluded that "laziness" and "savage braveness" were the main traits of the Zulu national character, which, unfortunately also illustrated the "weaknesses" of the same character; even if this could be related to natural and geographical conditions. He emphasized that although the Zulu were still on a "low level" in terms of development, they did not lack in possibilities; yet their rich potentials were still not fulfilled.

As late as in the 1940s, the Zulu male was in NMS publications represented as "the antagonism" of the European male. He was neither a man of will or thought, but a man ruled by his emotions – by affects, instincts and impulses.[40] Swedish historian, David Tjeder, finds the concept of *passion* to be central in modern Western discourses of middle class masculinities.[41] For a man to qualify as "a real man" he unconditionally had to learn to master his passions. In the nineteenth century passion was understood as an impersonal, threatening force residing within both men and women. A true man should be able to withstand, discipline and control his passions. Another crucial concept was the concept of *character*, the inner nature of man. Developing character was to develop inner, hidden potentialities. A man of character naturally had to control his passions. The struggle to master one's passion was grounded in power. Control over the passions meant not only power over the basic impulses of the self, but also power over others. Tjeder argued it was man's varying success in mastering passion, which legitimized why some men should have power, and others not.

Could immature men like the Zulu, ruled by their emotions and their explosive character, act like responsible and respectable leaders in the Lutheran church building process in South Africa? Stavem and Myklebust among others never formulated such a question, but their assertions of Zulu mentality and masculinity both reflected and reproduced the common understanding among NMS missionaries regarding potential, future Zulu church leaders. As we will see in our examination of the case of Baleni kaNdlela Mthimkhulu, Zulu church leaders were regarded and treated as young men with great potential, but as their inner emotions still were uncontrolled, they had *not yet* reached the level of mature manhood. *For a while* even ordained Zulu pastors were to be regarded and treated as the missionaries' subordinates. The necessary power and means to lead and manage the church as the missionaries' co-equals could not yet be shared with the Zulu people.

In this discussion it is important to distinguish between the white missionaries' paternalistic *son-discourses* and the white settlers' *boy-discourses*. According to South African historian Robert Morrell, the frequent white use of the term "boy" to refer to black men "captured a condescension, a refusal to acknowledge the possibility of growth and the achievement of manhood".[42] When confronted with white settlers' attitudes towards African men, which according to Morrell, involved "emasculation", the NMS missionaries defended the Christian Zulu man as a well-gifted man with great potential. In 1894 NMS superintendent Ole Stavem became involved in an official dispute with Scandinavian immigrants in Durban. Some of the immigrants had in Norwegian newspapers, as well as in Durban newspapers, where the "Mission Kaffirs" were accused of being the most lazy, bad and immoral men among Zulu men. NMS was further criticized for producing Christian men who were useless as servants and employees. Stavem did an extensive research among "prominent men" in Durban before he disproved the settler's accusations . He claimed that the Christian Zulu men who came to Durban from the Norwegian mission stations were respectable men of high moral. NMS-missionaries believed

---

39 Ole Stavem, "Zulufolket, dets Stammeslægtskab og dets Nationalkarakter", in *NMT* 41, no. 11 (1886), 212-217 & no. 12, 232-240.

40 Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika," 17-19.

41 David Tjeder, *The power of character: middle-class masculinities, 1800-1900* (Department of History, Stockholm University, 2003), 39-44. Tjeder's based his assertions on analysis of 250 Swedish moral advice manuals intended largely for a middle-class audience, and also autobiographies written by 76 Swedish men born in the period between 1783 and 1884. He further referred to influential works by historians who have examined the evolvement of modern, western masculinities, like E. Anthony Rotundo, *American manhood: transformations in masculinity from the revolution to the modern era* (New York: Basic Books, 1993); Michael S. Kimmel, *Manhood in America: a cultural history* (New York: Free Press, 1996); George L. Mosse, *The image of man: the creation of modern masculinity* (New York: Oxford University Press, 1996).

42 Morrell, "Of boys and men: masculinity and gender in Southern African Studies ", 616.

that Christian Zulu men, by the transforming and "civilising" effects of Christianity, over time could reach the same societal and cultural level as themselves.[43]

The case of Baleni kaNdlela Mthimkhulu

As we have seen, the representations of the *Zulu Man* in NMS-source materials were quite ambivalent. On the one hand, the Zulu man was regarded as superior among African "races", a physically and mentally well gifted man with great potential. On the other hand, he was portrayed as childish and immature, a man unable to control his emotions. In the following I will examine the background for the ordination of Mthimkhulu in 1893, and also the events preceding his dismissal ten years later. The alternate and arbitrary treatment of this first Zulu pastor in the Norwegian Zulu church reveals how this ambivalence regarding Zulu masculinity on a discursive level had practical implications for an individual man's life. According to missionary discourse and practise, even if a Zulu man became a Christian, or a Lutheran pastor, he would still be marked by an inherent Zulu "national character". As one NMS missionary expressed during the discussion of Baleni kaNdlela Mthimkhulu's case, "We must remember that even though he wears pastoral robes, he's still a Kaffir."[44]

Baleni kaNdlela Mthimkhulu was the first ordained Zulu pastor in the Norwegian Lutheran Zulu church. He should be regarded as a pioneer for other reasons as well. After the highly celebrated baptism of a young woman, Mathenjwase kaNondumo Shange on 6 June 1858, Mthimkhulu was among the first group of male converts baptised in the Norwegian Zulumission. This second baptism ceremony in NMS history took place on 14 July 1859 at Umphumulo mission station, and was conducted by Hans Paludan Smith Schreuder.[45] When Mthimkhulu became a Christian, he wished to be called Simon Ndlela, or only "Simon", and this is the name by which he is known in NMS records.[46] Ndlela settled at Umphumulo mission station where he later married a Christian woman and established his own homestead. He continued to work under the supervision of station manager Tobias Udland. In 1865 he received some basic theological education from newly arrived NMS missionary, Hans Christian Leisegang. From the early 1870s Ndlela assisted as a teacher in the mission school, and therefore became one of the first native teachers in NMS mission schools.[47] By 1875, after ten years of hard work, Udland joyfully reported to the NMS's Home Board that "God's good spirit" finally seemed to be effective at his mission station. Ndlela had recently led Sunday worship in a village outside the station compound.[48] Apparently the Zulu people in the area were eager "to listen and learn", and therefore, they decided to build their own chapel. This was actually the first time an NMS missionary in South Africa reported out-of-mission station Christian activity, initiated by one of his own Zulu students. Udland became ill and died the same year. But the work at "Simon's place" was so promising that some of the missionaries asked the NMS Home Board for permission to establish a new mission station in the area, something which was prohibited due to shortage in personnel.[49]

In the following years NMS missionaries continued to report new "outstations" or "preaching places", which were overseen by their Zulu assistants (referred to as teachers or evangelists). In 1879, *NMT* printed an article entitled "A nice Sunday in Africa", by missionary Johannes L. Kyllingstad, who described a visit to Ndlela's preaching place.[50] In 1881, according to missionary reports, Ndlela was impatient and eager, asking for authorisation to establish more outstations.[51] In 1887 there were reports of five outstations in Umphumulo mission district, with missionary Nils Bratvedt admitting that it was useful for his language studies to join the Zulu teachers on their Sunday visits: "It is strange how easy it

---

43 See 13 letters from "famous men" in Durban regarding Christian Zulu men in MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.92/Box 182, Jacket 19. See also NMS' 53rd annual report, Stavanger 1895, 59-62; *NMT* 50, no. 21 (1895): 417-424.

44 Statement from the discussion at NMS' Missionary Conference (MC) in South Africa 1903: Mission Archives (MA), School of Mission and Theology (MHS), HA/G.sekr.40/Box 42, Jacket 15: "Vi maa huske paa, at han fremdeles er en kaffer, selv om han har faaet krave om halsen".

45 *NMT* 14, no. 11 (1859): 186-188. Udland reported that one infant and six adults were baptised. The adults' new Christian names were "Utomase, Usimone, Ukosi, Uvelemu, Uhendreke and Unokutemba".

46 Prince Bongani kaShelemba Zulu, "The Ministry of the black people in the Lutheran Norwegian Mission Stations in Zululand and Natal from 1875 to 1963", unpublished conference paper, University of Stellenbosch, June 2009.

47 *NMT* 30, no. 6 (1875): 207-210.

48 Ibid., no. 7: 241-242.

49 Hans Christian M.G. Leisegang returned in 1875 to South Africa after a furlough in Norway. He sent an application to the Home Board where he asked for permission to establish a new station in the area where Simon was preaching, see *NMT* 30, no. 11 (1875): 421-422. Ole S. Steenberg asked the missionary conference in 1875 for a replacement from his work as schoolteacher at Umphumulo mission station to the position as evangelist among "Untimone's and Umkonto's people" some kilometres east of Umphumulo, ibid. 444. The mentioned chiefs are probably Umthimuni kaMudli Zulu and Mkhonto Ntuli, see Zulu, "The Ministry of the Black People in the Lutheran Norwegian Mission stations in Zululand and Natal from 1875 to 1963".

50 *NMT* 34, no. 7 (1879): 142-143.

51 Hans CMG. Leisegang in *NMT* 36, no. 10 (1881): 187-189; Petter Gottfrid Nilsen, ibid., 189-192.

seems for these teachers to preach. The words run like a stream from the beginning to the end."[52] According to mission statistics, the NMS Zulumission had eight native evangelists/teachers in 1885.[53] Five years later the number had increased to thirty-four. As the number of mission stations managed by NMS missionaries was more or less constant from mid-1880s,[54] it was the growth in outstations that characterised the period after 1880. As previously mentioned, the first outstation was established by Simon Ndlela in 1875.

By 1890 the number of outstations had increased to twenty-nine. There were forty-nine outstations in 1900, 109 in 1920 and 124 in 1939.[55] The number of converts also increased considerably after 1880. By the time of the 1879 Zulu-Anglo war, the Norwegian mission had around 300 Zulu converts. In 1890 church membership increased to 1,000. Post-1890 church growth continued – 5,000 members in 1900, 8, 000 in 1920, 14, 000 in 1930 and 20,000 by 1939.[56] Statistics of the NMS Zulu-mission confirms Peggy Brock's assertion that any discussion of mission and colonialism that ignores the armies of non-European evangelists "grossly misrepresents the grass-roots dynamics of Christianization".[57] Brock finds it to be a general tendency in modern mission history that "very soon" local agents outnumbered foreign-born missionaries. Also in the case of the NMS in South Africa, we find that while the numbers of missionaries was stable or decreased,[58] the number of Zulu evangelists and teachers increased. According to records, there were thirty-four Zulu evangelists and teachers in 1890, forty in 1900 and seventy-six in 1910. From 1915 reporting was more accurate and distinctions were made between Zulu pastors, employed /voluntary evangelists, teachers with governmental certification/non-certificated teachers.

Norwegian and Zulu personnel in the
Norwegian Lutheran Zulu Church, 1915-1930

	Mission-ary pastors	Female mission-ary workers	Zulu pastors	Paid evangelists	Unpaid evangelists	Teachers with certificate	Teachers without certificate
1915	16	4	7	77	36	17	36
1920	13	5	10	91	24	20	79
1925	9	5	13	106	29	37	78
1930	12	7	11	118	115	83	62

From the early 1880s, a recurring issue of discussion at the NMS missionary conference was on how to give Zulu church personnel a proper education.[59] In 1881 it was decided to establish a "Catechist School" at Eshowe, and Ole Stavem was asked to be the school's principal.[60] Four students completed the course in 1884,[61] but in the same year it was decided to close the school due lack of students.[62] In 1893 another attempt was made when Edward Michael Ingebrektsen was installed as principal of a new teacher's school at Umpumulo.[63] The Norwegian mission still lacked proper theological education for

---

52 *NMT* 42, no. 14 (1887): 272: "Det er mærkeligt, hvor let disse Lærere har for at tale. Det gaar som en Strøm fra Begyndelsen til Enden. Indholdet er ogsaa oftest bedre, and man kunde vente. Især for Sproget har jeg havt megen Nytte af at høre paa dem".

53 Mission statistics were presented in the superintendent's annual report which was published every year as a section of NMS' official annual report. In the case of South Africa, the quality of the statistics improved considerable after Ole Stavem took over as superintendent in 1888.

54 11 stations in 1885. In 1890 NMS established a station in Durban, and in 1915 Kangelani mission station was established.

55 Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika," 32.

56 Ibid., 132.

57 Peggy Brock, "New Christians as Evangelists," in *Missions and Empire*, ed. Norman Etherington (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005), 132-152.

58 Myklebust, "Sør-Afrika", 108-109. NMS gave priority to the successful field of Madagascar, and from 1901 China became a new and promising mission field for NMS.

59 For a general overview of mission societies' education of indigenous clergy in Protestant South Africa, see Joan Millard, "Educating indigenous clergy in Some South African Protestant Churches during the nineteenth century," in Philippe Denis, ed., *The making of an indigenous clergy in Southern Africa,* 58-68.

60 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 34, Jacket 21: Minutes from MC 1881.

61 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.90/Box 136, Jacket 3: Ole Stavem's report from the Catechist School in a letter of 30.09.1884..

62 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 35, Jacket 8: Minutes from MC 1884.

63 Ingolf Edward Hodne, *Missionary enterprise in African education: the co-operating Lutheran Missions in Natal, South Africa, 1912-1955* (Stavanger: Misjonshøgskolens forlag, 1997).

their evangelist and pastor candidates, but when the missionary conference of 1905 finally agreed to establish one, the NMS's Home Board did not sanction the proposal.[64]

In 1912 Cooperating Lutheran Missions in Natal (CLM) was established – a joint venture between the NMS, Church of Sweden Mission (CSM) and Berlin Missionary Society (BMS).[65] Although this was primarily an effort to establish a joint Evangelical Lutheran Zulu Church in Zululand, the immediate result of CLM was to provide an extensive financial and administrative co-operative between three educational institutions – the theological seminary at Oscarsberg (CSM), the evangelist school at Emmaus (BMS), and the teachers' college at Umphumulo (NMS). From 1912 onward, the NMS sent their evangelists to Emmaus and their pastoral candidates to Oscarsberg. Yet, as was the case in Madagascar from 1871, the NMS in South Africa never established their own theological institution.

According to the first constitution of the Norwegian Lutheran Zulu church of 1914, the missionary pastor functioned as manager of the mission station, as well as vicar of the district's outstations and preaching places. Zulu teachers and evangelists took care of daily teaching in the mission schools, as well as of outstations' Bible teaching, prayer meetings, evangelistic campaigns and Sunday worship. According to Lutheran church order, the ministerial acts of Baptism and Holy Communion, plus the conducting of church weddings and funerals, had to be administered by ordained pastors.

Seen against this background, it is noticeable why the numbers of ordained indigenous pastors did not cope with church growth. As already mentioned, the ordination of Simon Ndlela took place in 1893. Another twenty years passed before two more pastors, Jakob Nzuza and Metheu Mbuyazi, were ordained in 1913. At that time Ndlela had passed away. It was a watershed moment when an additional five pastors – Petrus Lamula, Philip Langeni, Elias Msomi, Salathiel Msweli and Josaya Semes were ordained in 1915. They all belonged to the first class of "Norwegian Zulu pastors" educated at the Oscarsberg Lutheran Theological Seminary. The slow growth of ordained pastors in the Norwegian Zulu church was noticeable in the next decades – ten pastors in 1920, thirteen in 1925, eleven in 1930.[66]

The ordination of Simon Ndlela in 1893

After the NMS missionaries started to ordain Malagasy pastors from 1883, the Home Board pushed for a similar development in its oldest mission: Zululand. This confirms the observation made by several historians, that when the ordination of black pastors commenced, it was only undertaken on explicit orders from home.[67] In 1884 NMS missionaries in southeast Africa were asked to discuss an expansion of itinerant evangelisation and outstation activities, as well as increased use of Christian Zulus as evangelists and teachers.[68] When the NMS's Secretary General, Ole Gjerløw, inspected the mission field in 1888, he requested an immediate ordination of indigenous pastors, and there seemed to be a common agreement that Simon Ndlela be a candidate for ministerial service.[69]

The issue of Ndlela's ordination was discussed at the NMS missionary conference of 1889, but it was agreed to postpone any decision in the matter.[70] Ndlela had recently been appointed temporary manager of Eotimati mission station while missionary, Petter Gottfred Nilsen, was on furlough in Norway. Since this was the first time that a Zulu evangelist put in charge of a central mission station, the missionaries found this to be a good test of Ndlela's leadership abilities. At the following conference in 1890, superintendent Ole Stavem reported that he had inspected Eotimati mission station and found every thing to be in good order.[71] Stavem was pleased by Ndlela's preaching, which he found to be both "awakening and encouraging". In the discussion that followed Stavem's report, several missionaries emphasized that the "time was ripe" for a Zulu pastor to be ordained: "We have

---

64 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 43, Jacket 11: Minutes from MC 1905. See also MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.91/Box 171, Jacket 2: Letter from NMS' Home Board to the missionaries in Natal and Zululand of 6.11.1905.

65 Herman Schlyter, *The history of the co-operating Lutheran Missions in Natal 1912-1951* (Morleigh; Durban: Lutheran Publishing House, 1953).

66 Mellemsether, "Misjonærer, settlersamfunn og afrikansk opposisjon. Striden om selvstendiggjøring i den norske Zulukirken, Sør-Afrika ca. 1920-1930" , 63-65.

67 Norman Etherington, *Preachers, peasants and politics in Southeast Africa, 1835-1880,* 25, 28. Lars Berge found the same to be true in the case of the first black pastor in Church of Sweden Mission (CMS); Josef kaMataka Zulu. Zulu was ordained in Uppsala, Sweden, in 1901, after a Home Board resolution. See Lars Berge, *The Bambatha Watershed. Swedish Missionaries, African Christians and an evolving Zulu Church in rural Natal and Zululand 1902-1910,* (Uppsala: Swedish Institute of Missionary Research, 2000), 260-263.

68 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 35, Jacket 8: Minutes from MC 1884.

69 Ole Gjerløw, *Beretning vedkommende Sekretærens Reise til Missionsmarken i Zululand og Natal 1887-88* (Stavanger: Norwegian Missionary Society, 1888), 48.

70 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 36, Jacket 11: Minutes from MC 1889.

71 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 36, Jacket 15: Minutes from MC 1890.

longed for this day", proclaimed Ole Zephanias Norgaard. He recommended Simon Ndlela "who for years has served his people with faithfulness, diligence and zeal".

While others worried that ordination of black pastors would imply "heavy responsibilities" for them as white missionaries, Nordgaard responded by saying they were too reluctant and anxious. He referred to Madagascar where NMS missionaries used available human resources. Martinius Borgen, who had some missionary experience in Madagascar, supported Nordgaard. Borgen stated that even if Malagasy pastors' level of knowledge was "far higher" than in Ndlela's case, the Zulu evangelist could beat them in character. The missionaries continued to discuss whether it was necessary for the candidate to receive formal theological education prior to ordination, but concluded that this should not be a restriction. They asked the superintendent to do the necessary preparations for Simon Ndlela's ordination.

The Home Board approved the conference decision of 1890, yet when the missionaries assembled the following year, an ordination of Simon Ndlela had still not occurred. Stavem explained the postponement as a need to assess "in what condition he hands over Eotimati" upon the return of missionary Nilsen, and also "how he separates from the position he now for a while has had".[72] Stavem reported to his colleagues that he had had discussions with Ndlela regarding a future transfer. According to the latter's own wish, Stavem had negotiated with British officials in Zululand and also with local chiefs. They had found a new place for him at Emamba, an area with a high population density on the Zululand side of the river Thugela. Ndlela was free to stay at these three acres of land as long as the British government allowed it. The missionary conference of 1891 expressed their pleasure at the prospect of a new outstation of the mission.[73] There was a drawback with the arrangement, however, as the place was given to Ndlela personally, and not to the NMS. Capital with which to build a chapel at the place was therefore not granted by the NMS, but Ndlela was supported with £10 for a new farmhouse he had to build for his family.

In 1892, when the missionaries again met for their annual conference, Nordgaard confronted Stavem with the question: when would Ndlela's ordination take place? He further claimed the missions' responsibility to build a chapel at Emamba, as they had done on all NMS' outstations.[74] The majority of the missionaries supported Nordgaard in his suggestion of an ordination as soon as possible and stated that Ndlela's ordination was of great importance for the church. Gundvald Gundersen, manager at Eshowe station, reported that he had inspected Ndlela's place and found both the evangelist himself, his preaching place, and his district to be not only in good order, but in fact "very promising". Nilsen, who had now returned to Eotimati from his furlough, confirmed that Ndlela had looked after his station in a good manner.

Stavem responded that Ndlela was "a good Christian man" but "unstable". As superintendent he still had not gained enough "courage" to ordain Ndlela and give him "an independent position". Stavem feared he planned to bring his adult sons over to Zululand, and that he envisioned becoming "a kind of a Big Man" over there. Despite Stavem's concerns, the conference agreed on a resolution stating that Simon Ndlela should be ordained "as fast as possible", that a school house should be built at his place and that his monthly salary should be £ 3 (£ 36 per annum).[75] To compare, the annual salary for a male NMS missionary with family was £ 150. "As fast as possible" turned out to be yet another year, and as already noted, the ordination occurred at the missionary conference of 1893. It is significant that this groundbreaking event in the history of the NMS Zulu mission was not even mentioned in the Superintendent's annual report of 1893.[76] What Stavem did mention, though, was the fact that Simon Ndlela had great success at his new outstation and by Christmas had baptised fourteen people.

The suspension of Simon Ndlela in 1903

The NMS's missionary conference decided in 1903 to suspend from service their only indigenous pastor, Simon Ndlela.[77] Sven Eriksen was the lone vote against a suspension of Ndlela. The strong supporters of Ndlela's ordination in early 1890s were absent from the NMS in 1903: Gundvald Gundersen died in 1902 and Ole Z.Nordgaard was himself suspended from missionary service in 1902

---

72 MS-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 37, Jacket 6: The superintendent's annual report of 1890.
73 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 37, Jacket 5: Minutes from the Missionary Conference in 1891.
74 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 37, Jacket 14: Minutes from the Missionary Conference in 1892.
75 By the mid 1870s Anglican Missionaries paid their evangelists £2 per month, and a salary of £50 per annum was thought sufficient for an ordained priest. The highest salary paid to any African by Christian missionaries in the 1870s was £75 per annum. Etherington, *Preachers, peasants and politics in Southeast Africa, 1835-1880. African Christian communities in Natal, Pondoland and Zululand,* 148.
76 NMS' 52nd annual report, Stavanger 1894, 53-72.
77 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 42, Jacket 15: Minutes from the MC 1903.

because of private mortgage problems. What was the background for this surprising decision, which never became officially known in the mission circles in Norway?[78]

Before I present in detail the events and processes preceding the dismissal of Ndlela in 1903, I would like to point out that indigenous clergy in most mission organisations in Natal and Zululand, which was integrated in the Colony of Natal in 1898, were exposed to the government's stricter attitude against African evangelists and pastors caused by the rise of Independent African Churches from mid 1890s.[79] In 1895 an Act was passed to regulate the use of Mission Reserves, and by the Mission Reserves Act of 1903 the Natal Native Trust took over the administration of the Mission Reserves. Particularly the black pastors in the American mission were subject to the government's growing suspicions, as an increasing number of them from the turn of the century were entrusted with own mission stations and congregations. From 1903 onwards, they were refused official marriage licences and were not allowed to preach in the Reserves.[80]

At the NMS missionary conference in 1902, Ndlela had been invited to take part in a discussion about the future of Emamba.[81] He had "been forced" away from Emamba "because of hunger", according to his testimony.[82] Fortunately he found a new place to live, at Esamungu, and from there he applied to the NMS for permission to build a chapel. He expressed his concern for the congregation at Emamba, that they should be taken care of. "If God provides me strength, I can try to reach them from my new place", he stated, but added that some help from the mission would also be necessary. Ndlela voiced "some complaints", including that his books were old and worn, and he could not afford to buy new ones. He also needed a baptismal plate at his new outstation.

After Ndlela left the meeting, the missionaries continued to discuss his case. The decision to keep Emamba as a Norwegian outstation was easy enough. During the negotiations, however, newly elected Superintendent, Hans Christian Leisegang, and Nils Aage Rødseth, the new station manager at Eshowe mission (the one responsible for Ndlela's outstations), both claimed they found several aspects of the Zulu pastor's ministerial service appalling. First, he had applied for a wage increase of £60 per annum instead of the current £32, an application Leisegang described as "meaningless." Second, he lacked proper writing abilities and could not keep the church's ministerial books in order. And finally, he had conducted "scandalous" marriage ceremonies, once between a white woman and a black man.

Leisegang did not keep secret his opinion that Ndlela's ordination was a mistake. Leisegang made frequent utterances about him, such as "he should never have been ordained, he is not mature enough", and "he may be good enough as a Christian, but that doesn't mean that he is well equipped to do everything a missionary can do".[83] Leisegang's proposal of restrictions upon Ndlela's ministerial services and responsibilities was accepted by the conference participants. Restrictions included that his catechumens at Esamungu who were ready for baptism should be introduced to the station manager at Eshowe two weeks before the ceremony. Also, marriage ceremonies at Emamba and Esamungu should be conducted by the station manager at Eshowe, and that the station manager at Eshowe should also conduct ministerial acts such as Holy Communion and baptism at Emamba. During the discussions in 1902 some dissident voices were heard. Gunnvald Gundersen declared that is was "not nice" of them "to take so much from Simon". Also, Nils Braatvedt feared that Ndlela could become "discouraged and hard".

At the following missionary conference in 1903 Superintendent Leisegang raised the issue of suspending Ndlela from pastoral service in the NMS and he asked Rødseth to explain the background for his proposal.[84] According to Rødseth, there had been some conflict between him and Ndlela regarding the responsibilities of Emamba outstation: misunderstandings he thought were settled. He was surprised, therefore, when he read an anonymous article in "the natives' newspaper",[85] where the specific conflicts between him and Ndlela were publicly displayed, and where serious accusations were raised against Rødseth (i.e., that he was greedy, that he was disloyal to senior missionaries, etc.).

---

78 It is not reported in the superintendent's annual report from 1903, neither in Lars Dahles's official report from his inspection trip, see Lars Dahle, *Inspektionsreisen til Zulu og Madagaskar i 1903. Indberetning til Generalforsamlingen i Bergen 1904* (Stavanger: Det norske Missionsselskabs Forlag, 1904).

79 Shula Marks, *Reluctant Rebellion. The 1906-8 Distrubances in Natal,* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1970), 51-82.

80 Ibid., 80-81; Clement Tsheloane Keto, "Race relations, land and the changing missionary role in South Africa: a case study of the American Zulu Mission 1850-1910," in *International Journal of African Historical Studies* 10, no. 4: 613-614.

81 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 42, Jacket 7: Minutes from the Missionary Conference in 1902.

82 This is confirmed in a conference paper by Zulu, "The Ministry of the black people in the Lutheran Norwegian Mission Stations in Zululand and Natal from 1875 to 1963." Zulu explains that Simon Ndlela as a farmer was hit by the 1890ss severe agrarian crisis, like droughts, infestation of locusts and the rinderpest.

83 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 42, Jacket 7: Minutes from the Missionary Conference in 1902: "Han kan være kristen god nok, men derfor er han ikke skikket til at udføre alt, hvad en missionær kan udføre".

84 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 42, Jacket 15: Minutes from the Missionary Conference in 1903.

85 Rødseth does not mention the newspapers' name, but John Langalibalele Dube established the first Zulu/English newspaper *Ilanga lase Natal* in 1903.

Rødseth immediately confronted Ndlela with the article, asking if he had written it. Ndlela first denied knowing anything about the issue, but when Rødseth pushed him to deny that the article described the relation between them, Ndlela could not invalidate that. Ndlela thereafter wrote a letter of apology which Rødseth personally brought to the newspaper's editor and which apparently was printed. According to Rødseth, Ndlela later sent two additional letters of apology.

In the conference discussion that followed Rødseth's account, there was common consensus that Ndlela was guilty, the one who had committed sins. According to Rødseth, Ndlela had shown severe insubordination. He had written an insulting newspaper article and he had lied to his superior. It was difficult, however, for the missionaries to agree about a proper punishment. Some asked if Ndlela had personally written that article, or rather, maybe he was protecting his sons or others who may have written it. They found Ndlela to be influenced by "unfavourable surroundings" – i.e., his sons and his wife. He could also have been influenced by "the Ethiopian movement", some said. Others emphasised that the concept of "lie" and "lying" was understood differently among Zulus and Norwegians. Leisegang and Rødseth repeated their assertion that it had been "a big mistake" to ordain Ndlela in 1893. It was even worse that some missionaries after Ndlela's ordination had made him believe that he was equal to the missionaries. Rødseth claimed that the late Gundersen (died in 1902), in particular, gave Ndlela the impression that he was "one of us". Gundersen should be excused, however, since the idea of equality was "the dominant opinion among the missionaries at that time.[86]

The NMS Secretary General, Lars Dahle, who was on an inspection trip to the mission fields of Madagascar and South Africa, participated in the conference of 1903.[87] After listening to the missionaries' discussions he formulated a proposal for the suspension of Ndlela from pastoral service in the NMS. Dahle's proposal was finally accepted by the majority of the missionaries. The proposal stipulated that out of consideration for Ndlela's age (about 70 years), his long and faithful service to the mission and his lack of other income, the NMS should continue to pay a monthly contribution of £1. It further stated that if Ndlela repented and expressed "honest" and "real" admission of his own mistakes, he could be restored to pastoral service. An eventual restoration should be suggested by the superintendent, and thereby discussed at the missionary conference, and finally sanctioned by the Home Board.

The question of Simon Ndlela's restoration became a topic of discussion at the next conference in 1904.[88] Rødseth explained that Ndlela had on several occasions repented of his sin and asked for forgiveness. Furthermore, Superintendent Leisegang had already given him a new appointment as evangelist and a salary of £2 per month. The missionary conference of 1904 agreed, therefore, to ask the NMS Home Board for permission to reinstate Ndlela as pastor, something they received. The conference of 1905 settled that Simon Ndlela, because of his "continuous humble mind", his age and his "good work", should be reinstated in his previous position as pastor in the Norwegian mission, with the restrictions in his ministry passed in 1902.[89] The NMS Home Board, in their comments on the termination of the Simon Ndlela case, remarked that they still had doubts about Ndlela's "inner conversion" and reluctantly approved the missionaries' wish to restore him to ministry.[90] The NMS could therefore not accept that Ndlela would receive his previous wage as indigenous pastor. An evangelist's salary of £2 per month should be "more than equivalent".

Simon Ndlela continued his service for NMS at the outstation of Esamungu.[91] He obviously was a humble man. In spite of the arbitrary and humiliating treatment he received from his Norwegian employers, he was known for preaching a message of love where Africans were encouraged "to appreciate God's love in sending the white missionaries from across the sea to preach the gospel among black people".[92] He died in 1910 after long and faithful service in the Norwegian Zulu church.

---

86 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 42, Jacket 15: Minutes from MC 1903: "Simon maatte, efter hvad der var sagt ham af Gundersen, faa indtryk af at han var som en af os. Jeg vil hermed ikke have rettet nogen bebreidelse mod Gundersen; thi dette var et udtryk for den opinion som den gang var raadende blandt missionærerne".

87 Karina Hestad Skeie found in her study of NMS missionaries in Madagascar 1866-1903, that Lars Dahle on the inspection trip in 1903 cancelled the internal processes of self-government in the Malagasy Lutheran Church, which in this case was encouraged by the missionaries. According to Skeie, Dahle's intervention in 1903 at one and the same time marked the end of what she calls "the Malagasy era" in NMS mission, and the beginning of a new "colonial era". See Karina Hestad Skeie, "Building God's Kingdom in Highland Madagascar.. Norwegian Lutheran missionaries in Vakinankaratra and Betsileo 1866-1903", dissertation for the degree of Dr. Art., University of Oslo, 2005, 273-313.

88 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 43, Jacket 7: Minutes from MC 1904.

89 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.40/Box 43, Jacket 11: Minutes from MC 1905.

90 MA-MHS, HA/G.sekr.91/Box 171, Jacket 2: Letter from NMS' Home Board of 6.11.1905.

91 Ole Stavem, *The Norwegian Missionary Society: a short review of its work among the Zulus* (Stavanger: The Norwegian Missionary Society, 1918), 60.

92 Zulu, "The Ministry of the Black People in the Lutheran Norwegian Mission Stations in Zululand and Natal from 1875 to 1963".

Conclusion: abandoned ideals of brotherhood

In this paper I have claimed that an original ideal of Christian brotherhood between Norwegian and Zulu male leaders in church and mission was eventually abandoned. One may ask if the original plan to recruit and educate Christian Zulu men for pastoral service – men who should rightfully have become the missionaries' co-equal workers and join a pastoral brotherhood – was ever practised. Did the Norwegian missionaries, as most Western missionaries, from the very start not act in a paternalistic way towards their newly converted Christian Zulu brothers? Can we speak of abandoned ideals if the ideals were never realised? I think we can, if by ideals we mean aspirations and expectations.

In the first decades of Zululand missionary activity, the missionaries had considerable aspirations for their newly converted Christian Zulu men. MZibokjane Ka Gudu, or Moses as he is known in Norwegian sources, was sent to the NMS missionary training school in Stavanger in 1866 where he studied theology as Ole Stavem's classmate.[93] No other Christian Zulu came to succeed Moses, and as we have seen, the NMS in South Africa never established a theological training seminary. During the celebrations following a first ceremony of baptism at Empangeni mission station in 1859, the three male Zulu converts enjoyed dinner together with the Norwegian missionary staff and were personally waited on by Station Manager, Ommund Oftebro, and Superintendent, Hans Paludan Smith Schreuder.[94] Several decades later Zulu pastor Petrus Lamula accused NMS missionaries of racist attitudes towards their African co-workers.[95] One specific example, according to Lamula, was the practice of separate meals during church conferences.[96] White missionaries and Zulu pastors ate at separate places, and they were served different food.

I have discussed why NMS missionaries in South Africa were so reluctant to fulfil their original vision of recruiting and educating indigenous church personnel. I have further asked why after their ordination Zulu pastors were still treated as the missionaries' subordinates. My conclusion is that internal church relations between these groups of men were influenced by external political and societal power relations where white masculinity had hegemony. Norwegian Missionary Society missionaries' ambivalent understanding of the Zulu man reflected common colonial discourses, where Zulu men were portrayed as "noble savages". Zulu men, Christian men and male clergy in particular, were from one point of view regarded as well-gifted men with rich potential. On the other hand, they were regarded as unstable, emotional and childish men, who had not yet reached the level of mature manhood, and therefore, were not yet qualified for the responsibilities of church leadership.

---

93 Torstein Jørgensen, "Zibokjana Ka Gudu Moses. Student fra Zululand ved Misjonshøgskolen 1866-69," in *Nordmenn i Afrika - Afrikanere i Norge*, ed. Anne K. Bang and Kirsten Alsaker Kjerland (Bergen: Vigmostad & Bjørke AS, 2002), 221-229.

94 *NMT* 15, no. 2 (1860): 50-51.

95 Paul La Hausse de Lalouvière, *Restless identities: signatures of nationalism, Zulu ethnicity and history in the lives of Petros Lamula (c.1881-1948) and Lymon Maling (1889-c.1936)* (Pietermaritzburg: University of Natal Press, 2000).

96 Minutes from MC 1927, MA-MHS, p. 67.