



## Medicines: Effectiveness or cost

**To the Editor:** Regarding the article by Chris Bateman,<sup>1</sup> I was horrified to see that I am readily identifiable as the journalist's 'source', as I had officially withdrawn and dissociated myself from all aspects of the article. The article is flawed and does not reflect the collegial nature of the discussions at provincial and national levels. It is ironic that the article attempts to debate the ethics of breast cancer drug allocation – but there has been a lack of ethical due-process in its publication. The lack of peer review is highlighted by the spelling of one of the prominent agents involved (i.e. the taxanes), which are spelt 'texanes' throughout the article.

This letter, however, allows me the opportunity to highlight the need for a formal review process for medicines in a resource-constrained health care sector, such as our own.

The way in which medicines are usually evaluated in the various sectors in South Africa is based on two criteria: effectiveness and cost. However, in reality, decisions are invariably based on expert opinion. Unfortunately, the emphasis is usually on either effectiveness or cost, and hardly ever on a systematic analysis that incorporates both considerations. There are a number of reasons for this behaviour: (i) lack of appreciation of the role of cost-effectiveness analysis in decision making; (ii) scarcity or absence of individuals with the necessary critical appraisal skills; and (iii) a short-term view of the consequences of health care decisions.

It is imperative that this kind of independent systematic analysis takes place for all medicines, so ensuring access, an equitable distribution of resources, and justice in the health care industry. Such a process will go a long way towards establishing an appropriate standard of clinical excellence, open to scrutiny. This is a critical ethical imperative in a resource-constrained health care system such as South Africa's, and for societal trust in the process.

### Marc Blockman

Department of Internal Medicine  
Division of Clinical Pharmacology  
University of Cape Town and Groote Schuur Hospital  
blockman@mweb.co.za

1. Bateman C. Vital breast cancer drugs highlight funding ethics. *S Afr Med J* 2008; 98: 833-836.

## Unhygienic male circumcision procedures and HIV transmission

**To the Editor:** Connolly and colleagues report one of the most detailed observational investigations of the association between male circumcision and HIV infection in sub-Saharan Africa to date.<sup>1</sup> They found no overall association between circumcision and prevalent HIV infection in South Africans. Connolly and

colleagues also suspect that the often unhygienic circumcision procedures among black South Africans may facilitate HIV transmission.

Evidence from Kenya, Lesotho and Tanzania is consistent with this hypothesis.<sup>2</sup> Circumcised males in these countries are typically circumcised in adolescence or early adulthood. In each country, circumcised virgins were substantially more likely to be HIV infected than sexually experienced males. Similarly, circumcised adolescent males were more likely to be infected than their uncircumcised counterparts. (In Lesotho young men circumcision was also associated with HIV infection, perhaps reflecting an older age at circumcision for Lesothoans than for Kenyans and Tanzanians.) However, in older age groups circumcised men were less likely to be infected than uncircumcised men. This pattern could partially be explained by increased mortality among circumcised adolescents and young adults (due to circumcision-related HIV infection), thus reducing HIV prevalence (or slowing its growth) relative to uncircumcised men in older age groups.<sup>2</sup> A delayed protective effect of circumcision, HIV-specific immunity acquired from circumcision-related exposures, and other factors might also account for this pattern.

For decades, substantial fractions of youth throughout southern and eastern Africa have identified circumcision as a risk for HIV transmission.<sup>2-10</sup> It is therefore crucial that more rigorous investigations beyond analyses of cross-sectional data be conducted to resolve the matter with confidence.<sup>2</sup> Future work might include detailed observations of circumcision procedures in different settings combined with prospective studies of adolescent and young adult males in communities where circumcision is common. Intervention trials of safer circumcision (compared with existing procedures) might also provide critical evidence, as might sequencing of infected youths' HIV DNA in both observational and intervention studies that focus on circumcision in specific communities.

### Devon D Brewer

Interdisciplinary Scientific Research  
Seattle, USA  
interscientific@yahoo.com

### John J Potterat

Independent consultant  
Colorado Springs, USA

### John M Roberts, Jr

University of New Mexico  
Albuquerque, USA

### Stuart Brody

University of the West of Scotland  
Paisley, UK

1. Connolly C, Simbayi LC, Shanmugam R, Nqeketo A. Male circumcision and its relationship to HIV infection in South Africa: results of a national survey in 2002. *S Afr Med J* 2008; 98: 789-794.