Disaster preparedness – looking forward

To the Editor: I refer to the article ‘Haiti: The South African perspective’ in the SAMJ of August 2010.

It is timely that the authors have opened the debate on the South African medical rescue response to disasters, particularly at home and on our continent. The problems are succinctly set out, real and need to be addressed meaningfully and rapidly. While the challenges are clear, the way forward as suggested in the article is less so. Given the less than organised, if praiseworthy, efforts of the two organisations mentioned in the article, it seems to be compounding the issue by suggesting that the future disaster response be placed under the auspices of the Emergency Medicine Society of South Africa (EMSSA) – another non-statutory body.

South Africa, as one of the most developed countries on the continent, will be expected internationally to respond meaningfully to natural and other disasters in Africa. To be able to do this will at least require government approval and resource support if there is to be a rapid and effective deployment of medical rescue assistance.

At the end of the day, most of the material and human resources required either belong to or work for one or other government department, provincial and national, including a large number of volunteers. In this particular context, I believe the National Department of Health in conjunction with those provinces that possess the requisite assets, which will include departments of emergency medicine, should take the lead. Together they successfully mobilised for the 2010 Soccer World Cup – surely an African disaster response is no less deserving of this kind of effort.

A G Mac Mahon
Cape Town
alanjean@telkomsa.net

Schistosomiasis – an endemic but neglected tropical disease in Limpopo

To the Editor: After malaria, schistosomiasis is the second most prevalent tropical infection, but is first among the neglected tropical diseases (NTDs). Worldwide, an estimated 750 million people are at risk of schistosomiasis, and 200 million have the disease; 85% of the latter and all 20 million with severe disease are concentrated in Africa.

We conducted a study that describes the pathology of biopsy diagnosed schistosomiasis, silent or symptomatic, in Limpopo Province to call attention on an NTD with potentially severe morbidity and mortality. This is especially important in view of the HIV/AIDS epidemic that poses a higher burden on women than men. Evidence is accumulating that female genital schistosomiasis (FGS) acts as a co-factor in the genesis of cervical pre-invasive and invasive lesions and/or as an entry point for the HIV virus.

Over the period 2008-2009, all new cases of biopsy diagnosed schistosomiasis were prospectively recorded. The diagnosis was made in the presence of viable (embryonated) and/or non-viable (calcified) ova; Schistosoma haematobium in the presence of a terminal spike and S. mansoni if the spike was lateral.

The patients’ age, gender, geographical origin, anatomical site and type of lesion, if any, were recorded. There were 266 females, and 45 males (F/M ratio 5.9/1). Table I illustrates the relative distribution by gender and affected organs, FGS accounted for 233 (87.6%) of the female cases; of the 127 cases involving the cervix, 29 (22.8%) were HIV-seropositive. Only 44 cases were asymptomatic, namely the incidentally found ova in bilateral tubal ligation (N=40) and prolapsed fibromyomas (N=4). In males, the appendix was the most common site – 30 (66.6%). The overall S. haematobium to S. mansoni ratio was 5.1/1. The ratio was 6.1/1 with urogenital pathology, and 3.2/1 with digestive tract pathology. These figures show an overlap of the two subtypes in urogenital and digestive lesions, and an overall predominance of S. haematobium. Of the cases of known geographical origin, 91% were from the northern and north-eastern parts of the province bordering Zimbabwe and Mozambique.

Failure in the supply of safe water sources and sanitation, and failure to control snail intermediate hosts, lead to the continued transmission of the infection. Control interventions require economic progress, political will and stability, and adequate public health structures and programmes. School-based health programmes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Organ</th>
<th>Females (266)</th>
<th>Males (45)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Upper genital organs†</td>
<td>74</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lower genital organs†</td>
<td>127</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perineum</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bowel</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bladder</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Varia</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

†Uterine body, adnexae.
†Cervix.

are a major tool to reduce morbidity. South Africa is a signatory of World Health Assembly Resolution 54.19 that calls on member states to take effective steps to control schistosomiasis and soil-transmitted helminthiasis. This calls for non-selective treatment of all children at risk, and targets the year 2010 for regular chemotherapy programmes.

The importance of such preventive policies is because praziquantel kills the adult schistosoma but not the ova. The ova cause granulomas, the entry and exit for the transmission of HIV, and possibly act as a co-factor in cervical carcinogenesis.

Louis-Jacques van Bogaert
National Health Laboratory Service, and
University of Limpopo
Polekwane
Limpopo
ljfvanbo@lantic.net


GP remuneration compared with non-health care costs

To the Editor: While working for the National Pathology Group (NPG) to help them understand the pathology cost trends in medical schemes from publicly available data, we came across two interesting relationships between costs in the private industry.

Medical schemes have lamented the inflation increase in pathology costs over the past 5 years. This gave rise to a Discovery Health advertisement in a medical publication, ‘Working together we can ensure a strong, sustainable health care system, where the increase in pathology costs was raised as a problem and doctors were requested to assist Discovery Medical Scheme manage these costs. In reviewing pathology trends against other trends within Discovery, using data obtained from the Council for Medical Schemes, we established the following.

Fig. 1 clearly shows that Discovery Medical Scheme experienced greater pressure in average beneficiary per annum (pabpa) trends for medical specialists (this measure excludes all radiology, pathology and anaesthesiology) and general practitioners in the 5-year period than the scheme experienced in pathology costs. This graph supports the Lifechoice view that it is the increase in members accessing specialist care that drives pathology, radiology, hospital and other benefit expenditure areas.

Comparing Discovery Medical Scheme’s non-health care costs (NHCs) against the other South African medical schemes reveals the other interesting cost relationship.

Fig. 2 shows that the NHCs of Discovery Medical Scheme, the biggest scheme in South Africa, are significantly higher than the rest of the industry excluding Discovery. The difference shown is more than the amount Discovery Medical Scheme pays the general practitioners who look after its members and what it spends on pathology. This cost comparison cannot be ignored.

This difference may also be seen in some other open medical schemes, and some argue that open medical scheme and closed medical scheme NHCs are not comparable (we are not convinced that consumers would see this argument as relevant).

Likechoice, together with one of South Africa’s most respected independent health actuaries, have researched the cost drivers in South African health going back to 1980. The costs of belonging to medical schemes have increased over 400% in real terms since 1980. The five most significant cost drivers seen over this period are:
1. A lack of focus by medical schemes on primary health care.
2. A focus on specialist curative care and the costs associated with this.
3. The hospital admission and other costs that result from the focus on specialist care.
4. NHCS.
5. Missing medical scheme legislation – the current legislation is only sustainable if all working South Africans are compelled to belong to a medical scheme (so-called mandatory cover), prescribed minimum benefits include primary health care benefits, and clarity is provided regarding exactly what is covered by prescribed.

We must indeed start working together to ensure sustainable health care. It is critical that as we do this, we focus on all of the above areas. Until we move towards models that support primary health care and fund primary health care properly, we will continue to see costs escalate.

Andrew Good
MD, Lifechoice
ago@lifechoice.co.za