Book Review

A book review tells us that Vinnicombe herself was keen to see an up-to-date synthesis of archaeological work done in the Maloti-Drakensberg region in the years since the publication of her 1976 book. Sadly, she died too soon to be part of this, but Peter Mitchell and Benjamin Smith have put together a substantial wide-ranging volume covering both rock art studies and the results of archaeological excavations. There has been a great deal of research in this area over the past 35 years with many papers published in a variety of journals, so it is extremely useful to have this compilation, together with new information and analysis. The editors’ introduction explains the background and rationale for the volume, and also that it accompanies the reprinting of People of the eland, now a rare and highly sought-after item of Africana. Chapter 2 is a delightful personal memoir by David Lewis-Williams, telling of his friendship and collegial relationship with Patricia Vinnicombe. It conveys something of the excitement they both felt at the breakthroughs they were making, and gives a very interesting account of their differences of opinion about the interpretation of the art, and how these changed over the years. Chapter 3, by Lynn Meskell, is entitled ‘Contextualising People of the eland’ and considers the book in the light of wider contemporary thinking in archaeology and anthropology.

The introduction to People of the eland tells us that Vinnicombe herself was keen to see an up-to-date synthesis of archaeological work done in the Maloti-Drakensberg region in the years since the publication of her 1976 book. Sadly, she died too soon to be part of this, but Peter Mitchell and Benjamin Smith have put together a substantial wide-ranging volume covering both rock art studies and the results of archaeological excavations. There has been a great deal of research in this area over the past 35 years with many papers published in a variety of journals, so it is extremely useful to have this compilation, together with new information and analysis. The editors’ introduction explains the background and rationale for the volume, and also that it accompanies the reprinting of People of the eland, now a rare and highly sought-after item of Africana. Chapter 2 is a delightful personal memoir by David Lewis-Williams, telling of his friendship and collegial relationship with Patricia Vinnicombe. It conveys something of the excitement they both felt at the breakthroughs they were making, and gives a very interesting account of their differences of opinion about the interpretation of the art, and how these changed over the years. Chapter 3, by Lynn Meskell, is entitled ‘Contextualising People of the eland’ and considers the book in the light of wider contemporary thinking in archaeology and anthropology.

In Chapter 4, Nessa Leibhammer examines different rock art recorders’ approaches to copying paintings, and the way these influenced subsequent interpretations. Interspersed through the text is a series of boxes on specific subjects, including one by Justine Olofsson on Vinnicombe’s tracing and colour rendering technique. Life as a rock art researcher in the 1960s and 1970s was sometimes, by today’s standards, shockingly difficult: in the early days, the Vinnicombe farmhouse had no electricity, necessitating visits to the local school to use a light table to redraw field tracings.

David Pearce, Catherine Namono and Lara Mallen survey the study of Drakensberg-Maloti rock art over the last fifty or so years, starting with Vinnicombe’s contribution. As they point out, we now
know a great deal more about San rock art than we did at the
time that Vinnicombe wrote *People of the eland*. In their words
(p. 75) ‘we broadly understand what San rock art is about, both
at the level of the art corpus and at the level of many classes of
imagery’. They see Vinnicombe’s contribution as falling into
three main areas: quantification, ethnography and history,
of which the second – her contribution to developing the
ethnographic approach to interpreting rock art – is certainly
the most important. This approach has produced spectacular
successes in the hands of at least some researchers, but it
has limitations – especially the narrow spatial and temporal
range of the very fragmentary ethnography that is preserved
– that Pearce et al. appear not to recognise, and certainly do
not acknowledge. In the concluding section of this chapter,
the authors write that the next focus in rock art research
should be ‘engagement with the art on a much finer scale’
(p. 75), i.e. interpreting the imagery in individual shelters,
understanding relationships between images and explaining
regional differences in art traditions. A major difficulty with
this last endeavour is the paucity of regional ethnographies.
‘Finer-scale’ work would no doubt be interesting, but is this
really the principal goal of current rock art research?

Elsewhere in this volume, several authors mention the
need to integrate rock art and excavated archaeological
records, a quest that will require better understanding of
the age of the art than we have at present. In a very useful
chapter, Aron Mazel summarises advances in the dating
of the Maloti-Drakensberg rock art. The best evidence
derives from radiocarbon dates for stratified archaeological
deposits incorporating paintings (or fragments thereof),
and accelerator mass spectrometry radiocarbon dating of
the images or mineral crusts closely associated with them.
This technique enables direct dating of very small quantities
of carbon, but in this context it is controversial because of
doubts about the origin and nature of carbon in these crusts,
and this approach would certainly benefit from more basic
investigative work. Nevertheless, there are now a number of
direct dates ranging up to 2000 to 3000 years before present.
Of course, older paintings may be less well preserved
and therefore more difficult to date. The chapter makes
no mention of portable painted stones from elsewhere in
southern Africa with substantially earlier dates,1,2,3 indicating
that painting in the sub-continent is older than has thus far
been demonstrated in the Maloti-Drakensberg area.

The following chapter, by Peter Mitchell, summarises the
results from archaeological excavations in the Maloti-
Drakensberg area, including many by Mitchell himself
or his students. There is much to summarise: almost six
pages of references are cited. This work has been done over
many years, by researchers with very different interests,
but he identifies five themes: understanding the cultural or
stratigraphic sequence, assessing the degree of continuity or
discontinuity in occupation, peoples’ use of the landscape
or mobility patterns, intra- and inter-regional contacts and
the impact of agropastoralism in the last 2000 years. One can
quibble with some points but, on the whole, this is a valuable
chapter.

It is frustrating that one of Vinnicombe’s research goals
– bringing together rock art studies and ‘dirt’ archaeology
– continues to elude archaeologists to this day. Research
projects to try to remedy this are in progress, but the quest is
ambitious. As several contributors to this volume point out,
this is partly because of the difficulty of dating the paintings
themselves, but also because painted images may be
produced over relatively short time spans of days or weeks,
while information from archaeological excavations has much
lower chronological resolution: only centimetres of deposit

---

Source: Photo taken by Peter Mitchell as presented in the book entitled ‘The eland’s people’
Sehonghong Shelter, one of the major archaeological sites of the Maloti-Drakensberg.

---
may accumulate (or be preserved) over millennia, and, at best, we can usually distinguish time-slices no narrower than several hundred years. This problem is not unique to rock art studies – I have encountered it in my own work on the bone chemistry of archaeological human skeletons, where there is also a mismatch between the scale of a human lifetime, as recorded in the skeleton, and the long-term averaging found in most archaeological sites. Nevertheless, if one frames the research questions carefully, it is possible to link (or contrast) reconstructions of ancient societies based on studies of skeletons with those derived from the analysis of excavated remains. The same should surely apply to rock art.

Whereas Mazel’s and Mitchell’s chapters for the most part synthesise published information, the chapter by Gavin Whitelaw comprises new work on the important topic of interaction between the Nguni and the San. If much of the rock art we can see today does in fact date to the last couple of thousand years, then the belief systems it expresses may well be more deeply influenced by farmers than we have previously realised. The point made by Sam Challis (p. 104), that in Vinnicombe’s research area, horses are the second most frequently painted animal after eland, may be significant here. Whitelaw examines the archaeological and historical evidence for interaction over the past two millennia, and proposes more nuanced scenarios than the idea that the San were unproblematically employed as ritual specialists and rainmakers.

The volume ends with a conclusion by David Whitley, including some interesting thoughts on Vinnicombe’s work in the light of broader trends in Anglophone archaeology and anthropology. Whitley, too, identifies chronology as an important issue, but his discussion of radiocarbon dating is unfortunately marred by several statements that are simply wrong. He ends with a discussion of ‘Archaeology as social practice’, mainly to do with relations between archaeologists and indigenous people, and the implementation of heritage legislation.

On the whole, the volume is well produced, though the first few pages, in particular, needed better proofreading – I noticed a number of typographical errors, and it is unfortunate that the table of contents wrongly attributes Chapter 2 to Mitchell and Smith instead of Lewis-Williams. Overall, this book is a valuable contribution to the literature on South African rock art and archaeology, and will be of interest to a wide range of readers. The reprinting of People of the eland in tandem with this publication is an especially welcome initiative. Rock art has broad appeal, and one notable feature of this volume is the number and high quality of the illustrations (although I was irritated by the way that many photographs are attributed only to the ‘RARI archive’ – the point is usually who took the photo, and when). Some chapters contribute new information about the past, others make a valuable contribution to the very poorly documented history of archaeology in South Africa. Meskell and Whitley attempt to situate Vinnicombe’s work in relation to the international archaeological world, providing much food for thought – we need more of this type of contextualisation in South African archaeology. Mitchell and Smith are to be congratulated on producing a volume that highlights many of the glories of South African archaeology, while acknowledging some of its shortcomings.

References