Social justice in community music and music education: Praxial musicking

Ronel De Villiers

Humanities Education, Faculty of Education, University of Pretoria, Pretoria, South Africa
ronel.devilliers@up.ac.za
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2195-3911

Esmari Oellermann

Advitech Primary School, Pretoria East, Pretoria, South Africa
esmari@elnatan.co.za
https://orcid.org/ 0000-0003-2843-2027

Abstract

In community music and music education, there is a notable resurgence in the commitment to advance social justice. This focus underscores the importance of making music accessible to all and, thus, ensuring inclusivity. Community musicians and music educationists are encouraged not only to contemplate but to support social justice causes actively and to integrate these principles into music education curricula. Unfortunately, many learners and students have been excluded from praxial music making opportunities because of historical neglect and unfair practices. Musicking is a practical, human action, central to Community Music and Music Education, and gravitates towards community (Small, 1998). The argument stands that musicking can therefore be a practical vehicle for community musicians and music educators through which social justice principles can be advanced. Underpinned by Elliot's (1995) praxial theory, Freire's (2000) critical theory, and Ebersöhn's (2012) flocking theory, in this qualitative study we used narrative inquiry to explore social justice in musicking through the lived stories of 18 musicians, from South Africa, Uganda, and Israel, who were involved in Community Music projects. We describe how community musicians have upheld inclusion, accessibility, lifelong learning, and transformation in musicking as fundamental principles in the fight for social justice.

Keywords: social justice, musicking, music education, community music

Introduction

In this article, we expand the scholarly landscape by discussing four social justice principles evident in 18 lived narrative stories from community musicians and/or music educationists. The research participants' professional practice demonstrated the principles of inclusion, accessibility, lifelong learning, and transformation. The research argument is based on the social justice principles that became evident to the participants via the vehicle of praxial musicking experiences in their daily music classes. To lay a foundation for this research, we discuss the aspects of social justice, musicking in Community Music (CM) and Music Education (MusEd), inclusivity, musical pluralism, and participatory and interactive musicking. This is followed by a discussion of the theoretical framework that consists of three theories, the literature review, and the methodological section that describes the data collection, analysis, and findings.

What is social justice?

People have different notions of what constitutes a just or fair society. What is agreed upon, however, is that social justice consists of three basic principles: "fairness as defined by treating individuals according to merit, by treating them according to need and by treating everyone equally" (Elliott, 2007, p. 62). Treating people according to merit, a practice termed justice as harmony, implies that people have different talents, abilities, backgrounds, and opportunities. Education should support these differences and reward hard work to strengthen the community. Justice as equity argues that more resources should be given to those who need them more. Justice of equality proposes that everyone needs to be given the same treatment all the time regardless of context (Smith, 2018). These principles are based on complex ideologies. Contextual and political views, culture, and world view play a role in how community musicians or music educators may interpret social justice. But how should community musicians and music educators interpret social justice in relation to the practice of musicking?

Social justice may be interpreted as "both a concept and a practice" (Silverman, 2012, p. 4). As a theoretical construct or concept, social justice is concerned with fairness in society and aims to protect, defend, and promote this. Social justice endeavours to protect and defend people against discrimination, ageism, and racism and to promote gender, education, and economic equality (Madonsela, 2020; Novak, 2000). As a practice, social justice principles can be applied practically in music-making activities in that community musicians and music educators intentionally design these activities with social justice in mind.

These praxial music-making activities used to be called *musicing* and can be explained as human actions done in specific "social-historical-cultural-political-ethical-economic contexts and value systems" (Elliott, 2012, p. 80). The cultural practices and belief systems of communities often surface in music-making groups such as bands and choirs, and in events like music festivals, music workshops, musical lessons, and even in music related media postings. Community musicians and music educators are facilitating many, if not most, such

music-making opportunities. Musicing, therefore, cannot be divorced from the concept or the practice of social justice.

Over time, the understanding of musicing has broadened. Small (1998b, p. 9) added the "k" in *musicking* to emphasise the interactive communal aspect of music-making, and said, "To [engage in] musicking is to take part in a musical performance, whether by performing, by listening or practising, by providing performance material (what is called composition) or by dancing." This is echoed by Mouton and Morelli (2021, p. 1), who defined musicking as "any musical contribution including, but not limited to, performing, listening, improvising, composing, and moving to music." The practice of musicking extends music-making in that it refers to a contextual functional human action (Elliott, 1995). This action has educative potential (Small, 1998) and a distinct communal focus (Odendaalet al., 2014). Consequently, musicking can be a vehicle through which social justice principles are advanced, promoted, and diffused between CM and MusEd.

Musicking in CM and MusEd

Musicking is characteristic of CM and MusEd. The overlapping practice of musicking becomes prevalent when enough musicians and music teachers reclaim it as "a form of human praxis" (Lum & Marsh, 2012, p. 389), and musicians and educators come to understand music as a process and not just as an end product in itself. This process should result in "the positive transformation of oneself, others, and one's community at large" (Elliott & Silverman, 2014, p. 14). Such transformation necessitates the application of social justice principles in music-making activities whether these activities occur in a community setting or in a MusEd context. Examples of such social justice principles in CM and MusEd are inclusivity, music pluralism, and participatory and interactive musicking.

Inclusivity in musicking

Although CM groups vary in many aspects, all participants are welcomed and included in the music-making process. Higgins (2012, p. 109) related the word "community" in CM to hospitality to indicate the unconditional acceptance of all people into music-making, regardless of age, gender, race, or previous musical exposure. The wide variety of CM organisations and projects that extend over various music genres worldwide is evidence of this hospitality. Similarly, MusEd scholars (Barrett & Veblen, 2012; Jeanneret & DeGraffenreid, 2012) call for inclusiveness. Most teachers in South Africa teach multicultural classes and this implies the inclusion and welcoming of all learners and students irrespective of race, gender, class, sexuality, culture, ethnicity, ability, and language. Odena (2009) pointed out that in MusEd, musicking can be used to make learners and students feel welcomed, included, and respected.

Musical pluralism in musicking

In CM, musicking is demonstrated through musical pluralism and is a collaborative non-didactic approach to musical engagement that highlights creativity (Phelan, 2008). In general,

MusEd best practice dictates that students should be "exposed and respond to a range of instrumental and vocal music" (Jeanneret & DeGraffenreid, 2012, p. 403). Also, music curricula should include presentational and participatory music-making opportunities (Harwood & Marsh, 2012).

Participatory and interactive musicking

In both CM and MusEd, musicking is an interactive, participatory process of active music-making that is creative and innovative. Although musicking activities may be pre-planned when the community musicians/teachers are following a holistic approach, they will be mindful of the learners/students' cultural contexts (Elliott & Silverman, 2014). There may be a shared goal between and among these participants, but the process is flexible and formal assessment is not the main aim. This process of musicking has far-reaching transformational benefits for individuals and communities. However, transformation is possible only when social justice as a concept is rightly understood and, as a practice, is intentionally applied.

Theoretical Framework

To steer the research argument of praxial musicking towards developing social justice in music classes, we were informed and guided by the following theoretical perspectives.

Elliot's (1995) praxial theory proposed seeing and using music as a verb (musicing) rather than a noun (music work). He described musicking as a human activity practised by individuals in societies as opposed to an elitist venture for a selected group of talented affluent individuals. This theory explains how people navigate towards eudaimonia (well-being) through active participation in music listening and music doing.

We applied Freire's (2000) critical theory as a critical paradigm since it creates an understanding of the transformative power of dialogue between teacher and learner, music educator and student, and CM facilitator and participant. This theory describes navigation through conscientisation aimed towards liberation and has strong links to the interpretive-critical paradigm.

Ebersöhn's (2012) flocking theory, given its focus on the process of generative relational support that helps individuals in communities to navigate towards resourcefulness, informed this research. This theory describes community navigation through flocking towards resilience, and provides insight into how relationship networks can be activated around musicking so that it becomes the vehicle through which social justice principles are upheld and promoted in communities.

The tri-theoretical framework links the concept of musicking in CM and MusEd with social justice in that it theorises how communities navigate towards liberation and well-being through resourceful networks. Musicking often facilitates the formation of these networks.

Literature review

Transformational changes have swept across the South African educational landscape in the post-apartheid era, but few disciplines have been as severely affected as MusEd. The status of MusEd seems to have diminished while the government was busy introducing modifications to national curricula. Since education is generally oriented towards discipline-based programmes, students often accumulate fragmented knowledge that is disconnected from real-life practices but MusEd offers a way of developing a more appropriate integrated and lifelong education. Social justice is found in various cultural traditions, interdisciplinary models, and integrated curricula and is, therefore, applicable to CM and MusEd.

What is social justice?

Novak (2000) explained that

> [s]ocial justice, rightly understood, is a specific habit of justice that is *social* in two senses. First, the skills it requires are those of inspiring, working with, and organising others to accomplish together a work of justice. The second characteristic of *social justice* rightly understood is that it aims at the good of the city, not at the good of one agent only. Citizens may band together, as in pioneer days, to build a school or a bridge. They may get together to hold a bake sale for some charitable cause, to repair a playground, to clean up the environment, or for a million other purposes. Hence the second sense in which this habit of justice is *social* is its object, as well as its form, primarily involves the good of others. (pp. 11–12, emphases added)

Drawing from Novak's explanation, we conclude that social justice, in essence, is a collaborative act that focuses on the good of the collective, is comprised of various social skills, and is reciprocal. Madonsela's (2020, p. 3) understanding of social justice is that it is a "just, fair, and equitable distribution of all opportunities, resources, privileges, and burdens in society." Social justice in CM and in the MusEd context refers to the awareness and dismantling of "societal, cultural, institutional, and psychological barriers to learning music" (Jorgensen, 2007, p. 169). The transformation of the learning processes, in terms of progressing from past injustices towards a fair future, incorporates a transition from a "traditional curriculum to a post-apartheid contemporary curriculum through [an exploration of] perceptions of Western and African music in the South African classroom" (Drummond, 2015, p. 25). Multicultural perspectives on the presentation of MusEd are incorporated into the construction of a post-apartheid contemporary curriculum. Seen through a Western paradigm, MusEd functions by identifying various music elements to construct a whole, whereas the African viewpoint uses a holistic perspective as a starting point and the different aspects are integrated into a whole. Analogously, the Ngoma principle that applies to Swahili culture, "denotes a musical practice that embraces the simultaneous expression of several musical forms, such as singing, drumming and dancing" (Mans, 2006, p. 66).

Salvador and Kelly-McHale (2017) described social justice as the recognition of and respect for marginalised groups, the removal of social barriers that hinder those groups, and taking

responsibility for helping those who need help. Music is part of the social fabric of community life. This means that CM and MusEd are obliged to be concerned with social justice (Jorgensen, 2007; Kertz-Welzel, 2016).

How does social justice apply to CM?

For CM, some of the core characteristics are point of view, access to musicking, access to development initiatives, and inclusion of all people. Lifelong learning (a social justice imperative) is also characteristic of CM (Veblen, 2013). Lifelong learning implies participation for all (Kertz-Welzel, 2016). Furthermore, inclusive and lifelong education is one of the Sustainable Development Goals for Education for 2015–2030 (United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization, 2017) and a global priority (Smith, 2018).

CM practitioners have concerns about how marginalised groups access musicking opportunities and many CM projects aim to empower and transform these groups in society (Silverman, 2012). Examples of CM projects include:

- those in low-income environments;
- those in conflict areas; and
- interventions for people with disabilities, people in jails, at-risk youth, immigrants, and refugees.

Oppressed people often use music as a liberating means to express themselves. Examples include the enslaved Americans who sang songs of freedom and young people who taught themselves to sing and play instruments so that they could have a voice in a world they sometimes found hostile (Jorgensen, 2007). In these situations, CM provides fellowship, hospitality, and a developing environment. CM also attempts to provide music opportunities without discrimination to give individuals and groups a voice. CM combats social exclusion and promotes well-being (Higgins, 2012). As Koopman (2007, p. 153) argued, "One of the strengths of community music is that it can reach out to people who for social, cultural, or financial reasons are unable to do so." CM values social justice by providing fellowship and acceptance of differences and facilitating access to music for all (Higgins & Bartleet, 2012; Silverman, 2012). The function and purpose of social justice from a CM point of view flow from this value in the sense that "social justice serves to uncover injustices, imbalances, and untruths to support and promote a more equitable social order" (Silverman, 2012, p. 157).

People are often excluded from quality education because of their background, demographic factors, intellect, and disability (Jorgensen, 2007). Smith (2018) agreed and pointed out that inequality leads to social exclusion. Marginals are not people living outside society; they are people on the inside who are excluded from it. Inclusion, promoting the community as a whole, and a greater awareness of what the pronoun we includes are fundamental to social justice (Freire, 2000). Madonsela (2020) referred to this awareness of we as the Ubuntu principle. This sub-Saharan philosophy is based on the belief that I am because we are. It implies that "embracing the humanity of every person so that nobody should find it harder than others to exist in society" (p. 5) is central to social justice.

How does social justice apply to MusEd?

In consulting international MusEd literature, we noted that social justice considers "the interests of groups of people, namely, those who are systemically prejudiced, discriminated against, marginalised and excluded in various ways from others in society" (Jorgensen, 2007, p. 174). Music educators in schools and universities must consider the practical implications of the barriers that hinder learning and that may result in exclusion. These barriers include demography, background, socio-economic status, and personal issues such as disability and intellect (Jorgensen, 2007). Freire (2000) listed social class, economic discrimination, and political power as essential elements of injustice but believed that education liberates, empowers, and activates learners to struggle for justice and freedom. Elliot (2007, p. 66) argued that "every aspect of cultural justice and social justice arise[s] from individual or group situations of intolerance, abuse, deprivation, discrimination, inequity, and other forms of injustice."

Levy and Byrd (2011, p. 64) noted that "accepting others, challenging discrimination, examining privilege, and rejecting violence" are concepts related to social justice that can be taught through MusEd. They give examples, appropriate to schools and Higher Education Institutions (HEIs), of how this can be done through song lyrics. Because most people enjoy listening to music, the words of songs can influence their worldviews. They illustrate this through two examples. Two primary schools used the songs by Elvis Presley, "I've got confidence" (1972) and "If I can dream" (1968) to relate how he overcame poverty. One high school used James Arthur's song, "Suicide" (2013) in a positive way to build self-confidence and increase social belonging rather than focussing on the negative effects and results of suicide. An HEI used the song by WAR, "Why can't we be friends?" (1975) to introduce and encourage class discussions about diversity. In addition to using lyrics, Levy and Byrd (2011) suggested incorporating various genres and choosing specific singers and songwriters. Of course, the political and cultural context must be provided for relevant discourse. These examples also indicate that music educators can use music as a teaching tool to stimulate reflection on social justice issues.

Salvador and Kelly-McHale (2017, p. 21) proposed to "reframe how music teacher candidates perceive quality, equity and justice." Elliot (2007) stated that music educators and community musicians should reflect on their ingrained assumptions and then build, engage, and participate actively in social coalitions with colleagues who are actively promoting social justice. Jorgenson (2007, p. 183) proposed that "music educators need to insist on a humane approach to music education [and] find ways to ensure broad quality music education that overcomes the host of barriers to music education and learning."

One way to ensure broad quality education is to include local and global cultural content in the music curriculum, thus creating glocalisation. The meaning of glocalisation becomes apparent in the approach taken in the latest South African National Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement (CAPS) document. The current CAPS includes Western Art Music (WAM), Indigenous African Music (IAM), and Jazz. It allows learners to create soundscapes with Western and African instruments. This means that "South African children

can use the unique mix of influences from their environments to enjoy a worldview that is particular to them" (Drummond, 2020, p. 152). This approach lends itself to social transformation because it adapts a Eurocentric curriculum towards a broad-based one, crosses geographical borders, and allows for the recognition of multi-heritages.[1]

Relevancy is another concept in the South African CAPS document that links to glocalisation.

> The National Curriculum Statement Grades R-12 expresses the knowledge, skills, and values worth learning in South African schools. The curriculum aims to ensure that children acquire and apply knowledge and skills in ways that are meaningful to their own lives. In this regard, the curriculum promotes knowledge in local contexts while being sensitive to global competencies. (Department of Higher Education, 2011, p. 4)

Drummond (2020) argued that the more formal approach to Western art music can be combined with the less formal teaching and learning strategies of African music. This would allow for participation at any level and encourage new ways of musical expression. Otchere (2019) indicated that African music has its central place in the curriculum because it is necessary and relevant. Still, she proposed a "pause and reflect" (p. 59) stance when decolonising the curriculum, for two reasons.

- African music's interdisciplinary nature and inter-functionality are too broad for the school curriculum to encompass.
- Learners in schools in the 21st century identify more with popular music genres than indigenous music.

Music teaching and learning strategies cannot be built on so-called "musical mother tongues" (Otchere, 2019, p. 71). Changes to the curriculum are a step towards democratisation and social transformation, but the music education system in South Africa is part of the nation's political and economic conditions. A gamut of factors such as the legacy of segregation, poorly trained teachers, overcrowded schools, and insufficient resources need to be addressed to alleviate the social injustice suffered by many learners (Oehrle, 2021).

Unfortunately, socio-economic and political systems change slowly, but in the meantime, teachers can play the essential role of helping learners reach their full development potential. Music teachers can nurture social justice by "empowering students to recognise that their own cultural identities are valid and respected" (Fitzpatrick, 2012, p. 54). They can ameliorate identity conflict by choosing the kind of music genres that learners and students value. These music genres should be educationally responsible, and therefore sourced with care. Teachers should also consider the cultural context of the learners (Oellermann, 2020) and reflect on how their backgrounds affect their behaviour in the classroom. By doing so, teachers ensure that they teach in a multiculturally sensitive manner. Culturally responsive

---

1   Learners are often confused when asked to dress according to their specific culture on Heritage Day, celebrated in South Africa on 24 September, because many learners have mixed heritages or are migrants, and these complex identities cannot be simplified as belonging to one culture.

teaching is "an equal educational opportunity initiative that accepts differences among ethnic groups, individuals, and cultures as normative to the human condition and of value to societal and personal development" (Gay, 2013, p. 50). Examples of culturally responsive pedagogy in MusEd include validating each learner's unique potential irrespective of their background. It allows into the classroom artists who reflect the learners' musical traditions and cultural experiences (Fitzpatrick, 2012). In addition, a multicultural approach fosters empathy, sensitivity, and understanding. These are attributes needed to create an awareness of social justice. Singing songs in original languages, playing instruments from various worlds, being taught guided listening, integrating learning, and collaborating with community musicians are all examples of a multicultural approach (Anderson & Campbell, 2010).

Another practical step educators can take to create inclusion is to form community-school partnerships to incorporate indigenous knowledge, pedagogy, and worldviews into MusEd (Prest, 2020). Silverman (2012) pointed out that teachers need to care enough to take up this responsibility. A group of South African music teachers shows that they care by providing MusEd to disadvantaged children in Gauteng through an outreach project. The Mamelodi Music Project began at the Mamelodi Secondary School and serves 15 other primary and secondary schools in the area. Teachers provide lessons on weekday afternoons. This project branched out and the Soshanguve Music Project that runs on Saturdays, was founded. The benefits of music education to the learners far outweigh the value of only their musicianship, since they

- acquire the discipline to practise;
- learn responsibility by caring for the instruments;
- build up their self-confidence;
- develop socialisation skills;
- learn to focus;
- aspire and dream; and
- learn to persevere.

Unfortunately, the sustainability of such projects is a problem. Swart (2020) warned that although music teachers advocate for the rights of their learners, "without the necessary government support, the future of MusEd in South Africa will sadly once again rely on the ingenuity and determination of local musicians and music teachers as well as international philanthropy" (p. 63).

Context and political views play a role in how social justice may be interpreted. However, it is also clear that social justice is inseparably connected to the principle that all people have value and should be treated justly and fairly. Community musicians and music educators should be verbal on this issue. They should reflect on how their background, values, and norms about social justice affect their music-making initiatives and take steps to ensure inclusive and lifelong learning in their distinct fields. Synergy may result when community musicians and teachers establish partnerships between community music and schools. Silverman (2012) reiterated that teachers and CM practitioners should enact social justice

through their actions, decisions, and planning. Mutual respect and an openness to collaboration may broaden the musical experiences of teachers, community musicians, and students (Higgins & Bartleet, 2012). Collaboration and teamwork expand music-making opportunities. If designed with care, this will produce cultural understanding, establish new networks, and create awareness for equality and inclusion (or, in other words, social justice) for the benefit of the wider community.

Methodology

Following Creswell and Poth (2018) we situated our research in an interpretivist-critical paradigm and followed a qualitative approach to explore the views, perspectives, and insights of the participants. Interpretivist researchers describe the phenomenon, the individuals, and their relations in a specific context thoroughly and elaborately, using a literary style (Hussain et al., 2013; Kivunja & Kuyini, 2017; Mack, 2010). The critical paradigm "stems from critical theory" (Mack, 2010, p. 9) and we used this in combination with the interpretivist paradigm. The critical paradigm aims at transforming socio-political and cultural environments to liberate people. Most importantly, it is "concerned with empowering people to overcome social circumstances that constrain them" (Ritchie et al., 2013, p. 16). Our qualitative approach led to our understanding of the views, perspectives, and insights of the participants. As Maree (2016, p. 55) asserted, in "exploratory studies, qualitative data predominates" and we regarded this as a dynamic undertaking that required flexibility and time.

We explored the stories of 18 musicians who facilitated or directed CM projects through narrative inquiry as our method of primary data collection. Narrative inquiry in the qualitative interpretivist paradigm approach implies that we, as researchers, depend on the research participants' views of the phenomenon being studied. Narrative inquiry is an art form since narrative inquirers compose stories while working in the metaphorical three-dimensional space, always keeping track of each story's wholeness. All 18 community musicians agreed to discuss their musicking experiences in the social contexts in which they occurred. Each of the 18 musicians, having worked in a CM setting at some stage, had a unique story to tell.

Formal music training or a music education qualification was not a prerequisite; the selection criteria were as follows.

- The participants had to be musicians affiliated with an existing CM project or be musicians from the community engaging in community music projects that involve learners.
- Participants could be located at different sites, but these sites had to be accessible and feasible (Maree, 2016).
- Participants had to engage in musicking.
- Participants could be part of a sponsored programme or involved in a private project that was funded.
- Participants had to be involved in the community.

- Participants could not expect financial gain or commercialism as the aim of the project.
- Participants' programmes had to be directed towards learners.
- Participants had to be able to speak English or Afrikaans.

Community musicians who participated as research participants included eight from four South African provinces, five from Kampala, Uganda, and three from Jerusalem and Bethany, Israel. As Yin (2016) pointed out, a variety of participants from different contexts yield richer data.

Secondary data was composed of field texts consisting of conversations, photos, pictures, semi-structured follow-up interviews, notes from observations (see Clandinin, 2006), shared experiences, journal records, newsletters, postings on YouTube, websites, and metaphors (in the form of vignettes).

Given its legacy of apartheid, South Africa is a microcosm of profound contradictions. CM projects were not a priority during apartheid because of historical neglect and the political views of the time. Freire's critical theory (2000) gave us valuable insights because he worked with oppressed adults when he developed this theory that centres on transformation and social justice. Relatively recently, researchers have highlighted various focus areas in CM projects situated in an educative context in impoverished communities (Ahlers, 2018; Fouché & Stevens, 2018; Harrop-Allin, 2017).

Uganda is an ethnically diverse East African country and is seen to be one of the world's youngest and fastest-growing countries (World Bank, 2023). Although Uganda is called Africa's breadbasket (Hassan, 2020), it experiences challenges such as a decline in agricultural productivity, massive population growth, unemployment, poverty, and inadequate education. Children who start school when they are four years of age are expected to complete only seven years of schooling by the time they are 18. Music is taught in government and private schools, although the quality of MusEd in private schools excels because of available resources. Calls are being made for the government to partner with the Pan African Society for Music Arts Education to improve the quality of MusEd at schools (Kigozi, 2015).

The Israeli-Palestinian conflict is one of the world's enduring hostilities and its impact on communities is significant. Community musicians who facilitate community music projects in Arab-Israeli communities and orphanages were contacted to participate in this study. The CM "Live Music Encounters Project" involves preschools, primary, and secondary schools in different cities of Jewish and Arab inhabitants. Musicking, a central practice embedded in Elliot's (1995) praxial theory of active music-making, was used to bridge animosity among children of different religions in conflict-prone communities in Israel, so being able to work with these community musicians partnering with schools in a conflict zone added significant value to this study since inclusion and social cohesion are characteristic of CM practices.

Ebersöhns's (2012) African psychosocial theory embedded in Ubuntu principles provided a framework for this inquiry. In contrast to Western psychology that centres on individual

support, we were interested in how relationship networks can be activated in the context of musicking as a cultural resource since this empowers individuals towards resourcefulness and therefore provides a better future for communities (Ebersöhn, 2020, p. 4).

The research sites in South Africa were located in four of the nine provinces: the Western Cape; Kwa Zulu Natal (KZN); the Free State; and Gauteng.

In the Western Cape, three CM project leaders participated.

- One community musician had facilitated a small CM project as part of an aftercare centre supported by a non-profit organisation.
- Another had a lifelong involvement in children's ministry with musicking, revues, workshops, radio work, and various pre and primary school programmes.
- A CM project leader had established a CM project that focused on social cohesion. She provided non-formal MusEd and facilitated various musicking opportunities for the surrounding communities.

In KZN, we observed a choir practice at a community project's village school. Here, the CM project leader and her husband focus on the holistic development of vulnerable children. In the Free State, we found a well-established CM project aimed at extending MusEd to children in previously disadvantaged communities. In central Gauteng, we interviewed a community musician who facilitated a value-driven CM project in a primary Afrikaans school. While attending a marimba practice in southern Gauteng at a community centre, we interviewed the CM project leader at her home. Although the project was based in the southern part of Gauteng, it hosted and supported marimba hubs in most of the nine provinces in South Africa. Another participant, a music teacher at a private school in Gauteng facilitated CM programmes in Gauteng before he accepted a full-time teaching position.

No CM project sites were visited in Uganda. All the Ugandan participants were interviewed in Kampala. However, to understand the teaching environment to familiarise ourselves with how musicking occurred in private primary schools, we visited a school in a rural village and one in an urban area of Kampala. In addition, we observed music students performing at one of the leading hotel groups in Kampala as part of their practical HEI training.

In Israel, we interviewed a South African participant who speaks Afrikaans and facilitates musicking experiences in an orphanage as well as two Jewish Israelis involved in various CM projects. Another project based in an Arab orphanage could not be visited because it is located in a Palestinian-controlled area and we were advised against entering the area for reasons related to safety. Arab Israelis, who were mainly Muslim, and messianic Jews who were primarily Christian, along with secular and orthodox Jews explained the religious complexity and how it affects musicking in CM projects in Israel. Messianic Jews facilitated the musicking opportunities in a predominantly Arab orphanage.

Data analysis process

The data analysis spiral enabled us to depict the essential elements needed, following Creswell and Poth's (2018) three steps of organising, coding, and presenting the data through a detailed report to address the essential elements. Organising data involved filing and securely storing the observation notes, interview transcripts, documents, and audio-visual material as files on the first author's computer prior to being uploaded into a data analysis program. We read and reread the collected data several times to familiarise ourselves with it before we began coding.

Moen (2006, p. 62) described creating a narrative as "a process that organises human experience into meaningful episodes." To assist in creating a new narrative about social justice, we used data software to link, classify, sort, and arrange data systematically, since qualitative research generates extensive data (Bryman, 2016). All the transcribed interviews, observational notes, and audio-visual material were uploaded into ATLAS.tiTM Version 9 (ATLAS.ti) which simplified the coding, referencing process, and data analysis. This created a truthful summary and interpretation of what the participants said.

Findings

Following Odena (2009), participants in all three countries were asked to be verbal on social justice issues as they responded to questions about inclusion, accessibility, lifelong learning, and transformation.

Inclusion

At significant personal risk, participants continued to pursue social justice principles regardless of the cultural and political ideologies of the place and day. For example, one participant continued CM activities in the dangerous neighbourhood of Bethany, in Israel, while others took a stand against unjust laws and continued with inclusive CM projects in South Africa. In addition, participants in Uganda intentionally chose music that supported diversity, and inclusive musicking activities and were flexible and adaptive in their teaching and learning approaches.

An Israeli participant said,

> Jy hoef nie opgelei te wees om musiek te kan doen nie, of iemand te bereik deur musiek nie [You do not have to be a trained musician to be able to make music or reach out to people through music].

This Afrikaans-speaking participant worked among Jewish and Arabic children in various orphanages in Israel. She has no formal music training but does play the piano. She started art therapy among mentally disabled Arabic-speaking orphans but changed her practice to using music. Not being trained as a music therapist, she sought the expertise of a formally trained Israeli musician involved in CM projects. Over six months, he taught her and her team which

instruments to use, how to use them, and what genres of music work well in specific settings. They bought a variety of classroom instruments and divided the orphans into different groups according to their ability and taught them how to keep the beat. Orphans and staff sang along and even danced with people in wheelchairs. Joined by two other Israeli participants they led the musicking sessions with guitar accompaniment. After six months, she felt equipped to carry on by herself. She does not consider herself a musician, but continues to be involved in CM. She has experienced the therapeutic value of music herself and has seen how much happiness and joy orphans and orphanage staff alike have in musicking together.

Accessibility

Inclusivity is about optimal and equal access and involves designing systems and processes to ensure this. Participants purposefully reached out to children who, on their own, could not afford MusEd lessons. They adapted musicking experiences and went to great lengths to obtain funding and secure scholarships to ensure that more children could have access to these opportunities.

Dr Kigozi, a participant from Uganda, gave us permission to use his name. His illuminating statement was that "[e]very kid should have the opportunity and access to music if they want it." Born near Namirembe Cathedral, he started attending the church choir with his younger brother. He sang and played different choir roles. He taught himself how to play the piano since he knew how to read music, a skill he obtained through choir training. During high school, he took music as a subject and learned to play the keyboard and, later, the organ. Apart from being involved in choirs, he also joined bands in which he became the principal keyboard player. His involvement in CM extends over many decades. He conducted and toured with the Watoto church children's choir. He also set up and toured with another orphanage choir in the Netherlands. As a musician, he became a paid jazz pianist and secured a long-standing contract with the Sheridan Hotel and played in various countries. As a lecturer, he taught in his hometown in Zimbabwe and his musicking experiences also included directing several choirs and playing in bands. He also studied accounting and law, and completed a PhD degree in MusEd. He became the executive of the Pan African Society for Musical Arts Education, was elected to the board of the International Society for Music Education and contributed to the International Journal of Music Education. Today Dr Kigozi publishes widely, is involved in the University of Makerere, and heads up the Department of Performing Arts in Uganda's most significant international school. He has a heart for community and can often be seen among his students, mentoring them in various musicking activities which he plans, structures, and manages. When asked about his motivation behind his energetic engagement in CM, he answered,

> It's because when I see the students that I worked with go out there and use the skills and talents that we give them to earn a livelihood . . . But also, I've been in situations where I've got students [who] used the skills that were given them in music for social change . . . For me as an educator, it gives me the drive to work with them.

Lifelong learning

Some participants actively strategised with HEIs and government structures to ensure accessibility and lifelong learning opportunities for children who wish to engage in the arts. To support lifelong learning, participants created alumni groups. A participant from South Africa, who works in a remote rural area, said,

> So, whether we're in a community setting . . . We see ourselves as mom and dad . . . it's a relationship all the time. Music is the vehicle, but even in the private lessons . . . it's connections, it's investing, and the trust grows.

This participant and her husband perceive themselves to be music teachers but also father and mother to many vulnerable children. She has non-formal training in voice and piano but completed all the London Trinity exams. She is also a licensed music therapist. Her husband owns a recording studio and is a qualified music producer and sound engineer. They established a private music academy and have been teaching children how to play various instruments and their musicking experiences include involvement in a community church band. Jointly, they oversee music development in a village for vulnerable children in a rural area. They tour nationally and internationally with the village children's choir. The choir has different levels as young children start to sing and learn tonic sol-fa. When they are ready, they join the Level 2 choir that tours nationally. The Level 3 choir tours internationally and the Level 4 choir consists of young alumni who have completed the South African Matric school exam. The choir teams up with local musicians and has performed with the KwaZulu-Natal philharmonic orchestra on occasion. Some alumni students currently study MusEd at various South African universities. Scholarships are sought for and secured for these students. The choir and children's village are funded through a joint venture of businesses, community, and government. The choir raises funds for the children's village and represents the village as its voice.

Transformation

All the participants supported transformation enthusiastically, in line with CM's ethics. Participants did so by observing societal challenges and addressing them in their sphere of influence by encouraging conscientisation and dialogue to encourage transformation, as Freire (2000) suggested. Participants actively pursue musicking opportunities that provide exposure to children, thus enabling them to reflect on the latter's position in the world and take steps to improve it. Children and students in South Africa and Uganda are exposed to international concerts, festivals, and competitions. In addition, participants encourage musical dialogue through the musicking experiences where they, in turn, learn to listen to one another. Dialogue at all levels, among students, and between the CM facilitator and students is encouraged. Participants' continued engagement with the children in the teaching and learning strategy even after they have left the CM programmes reflects their emphasis on inclusivity, lifelong learning, and the importance of students' transformation into productive members of society.

A participant from South Africa provided a valuable example of how community musicians can be cognisant of the political laws and practices of the day and still uphold social justice principles to protect developing musicians from racism and discriminatory practices in MusEd. He explained,

> Ek het toe besluit, man ons moet iets doen, want een van die dae is apartheid verby, en ons moet met die swart skole begin werk [I then decided that we had to do something; one-day apartheid will pass and we will have to start working with the black schools].

This participant grew up in rural South Africa and remembered his family listening to opera on long-playing records. He began his musical journey with piano and, at the age of nine, started violin lessons and went on to complete a MusEd degree. Together with his wife, he became involved in MusEd, and their musicking experiences included being part of various symphonic orchestras during apartheid in South Africa. As a music teacher, he had to participate in the regional orchestra. Being community-oriented, he decided to extend MusEd to nearby black township schools in the Free State. That was against the segregation laws of the time, but these white South Africans obtained the contact details of Sotho-speaking choir leaders in black churches and nearby township schools. The Sotho nation was singing, and the choir leaders understood and used tonic sol-fa, but they could not read staff notation. They collaborated with other music educators who shared their vision and started teaching solfège to these choir leaders as a bridge between tonic sol-fa and staff notation. Although they faced disciplinary action from the Department of Education, they also went to Black schools and offered private music lessons to Black learners. They collaborated with an American musician living in South Africa who organised funding and structured the community music project into a long-running, successful endeavour. Today, learners are provided with string instruments, receive free transportation and group tuition, and later, if they show potential, receive private education. Children play in string ensembles at beginner, intermediate, and world-class touring level, and frequently perform nationally and internationally. Our participant mentioned that although the young musicians were excellent performers, the theoretical component of MusEd lagged behind. This complicated matters for these students when they wanted to further their studies in MusEd at HEIs. Although both our participant and his wife are retired, they are still involved in this community music project and their involvement enhances musical intervention. They help their senior students to complete diplomas or MusEd degrees so that they may secure careers in music. A heart for community and the value of inclusion make this couple visionary leaders in CM and MusEd in South Africa.

The four social justice principles lie at the heart of CM and MusEd and demonstrate that, in the hands of skilled and mindful musicians, praxial musicking may be a tool to promote social justice.

Conclusion

In agreement with Kim (2016, p. 237), we intended to "make this world a better place or to improve the human condition to the extent that we breathe social justice just as we breathe air in our daily lives." In the context of CM and MusEd, the world could be a better place for community musicians and music educators through musicking. As one research participant asked, "Why don't we let the communities take care of MusEd?" That question begs to be answered. An Israeli research participant remarked that you could be an excellent musician creating social justice, though playing on the street. Musicking cuts through all the layers of society despite the inadequacies of systems and processes, the injustices in societies, and the incompetency that plagues humanity. Musicking facilitates eudaimonia in the hands of competent community musicians and music educators. Musicking, whether done in a CM or MusEd context, can create social justice in a society.

References

Ahlers, D. (2018). *Exploring the meaning of community music activities: a collective case study* [Doctoral thesis, North-West University, RSA]. https://dspace.nwu.ac.za/bitstream/handle/10394/28617

Anderson, W. M., & Campbell, P. S. (2010). Teaching music from a multicultural perspective. *Multicultural Perspectives in Music Education*, 3,1–7. https://doi.org/10.1177/104837139200500311

Arthur. J., (2013). Suicide [Song]. On Spotify http://smarturl.it/JamesA

Barrett, J. R., & Veblen, K. K. (2012). Meaningful connections in a comprehensive approach to the music curriculum. In G. E. McPherson & G. F. Welch (Eds.), *Music learning and teaching in infancy, childhood and adolescence* (pp. 361–380). Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199730810.013.0022

Bryman, A. (2016). *Social research methods* (5th ed.). Oxford University Press.

Clandinin, D. J. (2006). Narrative inquiry: A methodology for studying lived experience. *Research Studies in Music Education*, *27*(1), 44–54. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103x060270010301

Creswell, J. W., & Poth, C. N. (2018). *Qualitative inquiry & research design: choosing among five approaches* (4th ed.). SAGE.

Department of Higher Education. (2011). Curriculum and Assessment Policy Statement - Life Skills - Foundation Phase. Retrieved 26 April, 2020, from https://www.uj.ac.za/faculties/facultyofeducation/eli/Documents/Life-Skills-CAPS-FP-Feb-2011.pdf

Drummond, U. (2015). *Music education in South African Schools after apartheid: Teacher perceptions of Western and African Music*. [Unpublished DEd Dissertation. http://theses.gla.ac.uk/6298/]

Drummond, U. (2020, 3–7 August). *Glocalization in post-apartheid South African school music education policy*. [Conference Session]. The International Society for Music Education. 34th World Conference on Music Education, Helsinki, Finland. https://www.isme.org/sites/default/files/documents/Proceedings%20final%202020%20ISME%20WORLD%20CONFERENCE.pdfhttps://www.isme.org/sites/default/files/documents/Proceedings%20final%202020%20ISME%20WORLD%20CONFERENCE.pdf

Ebersöhn, L. (2012). Adding 'flock'to 'fight and flight': A honeycomb of resilience where supply of relationships meets demand for support. *Journal of Psychology in Africa*, *22*(1), 29–42. https://doi.org/10.1080/14330237.2012.10874518

Ebersöhn, L. (2020). *Flocking together: An indigenous psychology theory of resilience in Southern Africa.* Springer Cam. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-16435-5

Elliott, D. J. (2000). Music and affect: the praxial view. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, *8*(2), 79–88.

Elliott, D. J. (2007). "Socializing" music education. *Action, Criticism, and Theory for Music Education*, *6*(4), 60–95. https://doi.org/10.22176/act

Elliott, D. J. (2012c). *Music education philosophy.* In G. E. McPherson & G. F. Welch (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music education* (Vol. 1). Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199730810.013.0005_update_001

Elliott, D. J., & M. Silverman. (2012). Why music matters: Philosophical and cultural foundations. In R. MacDonald, G. Kreutz & L. Mitchell (Eds.), *Music, health, and wellbeing* (pp. (942–1447). Oxford. https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780199586974.003.0003

Elliott, D. J., & Silverman, M. (2014). Music matters: *A philosophy of music education* (2nd ed.) Oxford University Press.

Fitzpatrick, K. R. (2012). Cultural diversity and the formation of identity: Our role as music teachers. *Music Educators Journal*, *98*(4), 53–59. https://doi.org/10.1177/0027432112442903

Fouché, S., & Stevens, M. (2018). Co-creating spaces for resilience to flourish: A community music therapy project in Cape Town, South Africa. *Voices: A World Forum for Music Therapy*, *18*(4). https://doi.org/10.15845/voices.v18i4.2592

Freire, P. (2000). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. Routledge.
https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003060635-5

Gay, G. (2013). Teaching to and through cultural diversity. *Curriculum Inquiry*, *43*(1),
48–70. https://doi.org/10.1111/curi.12002

Hammond, B-R. (2020). *Approaches to social justice in community music settings*. [Master's
dissertation, McGill University, Montreal, Canada].
https://www.cfmta.org/docs/essays/CFMTA

Harrop-Allin, S. (2017). Higher education student learning beyond the classroom: Findings
from a community music service learning project in rural South Africa. *Music
Education Research*, *19*(3), 231–251.
https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2016.1214695

Harwood, E., & Marsh, K. (2012). *Children's ways of learning inside and outside the
classroom*. In G. E. McPherson & G. F. Welch (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music
education* (Vol. 1). Oxford University Press.
https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199730810.013.0020_update_001

Hassan, R. (2020). Education in Uganda. *World Education News & Reviews.*
https://wenr.wes.org/2020/10/education-in-uganda.

Higgins, L. (2012). *The community within community music*. In G. E. McPherson & G. F.
Welch (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music education* (Vol. 2). Oxford University
Press.

Higgins, L., & Bartleet, B.-L. (2012). *The community music facilitator and school music
education.* In G. E. McPherson & G. F. Welch (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music
education* (Vol. 1). Oxford University Press.
https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199730810.013.0030

Hussain, M. A., Elyas, T., & Nasseef, O. A. (2013). Research paradigms: A slippery slope for
fresh researchers. *Life Science Journal*, *10*(4), 2374–2381.

Jeanneret, N., & DeGraffenreid, G. M. (2012). *Music education in the generalist classroom*.
In G. E. McPherson & G. F. Welch (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music education*
(Vol. 1). Oxford University Press.
https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199730810.013.0024_update_001

Jorgensen, E. R. (2007). Concerning justice and music education. *Music Education Research*,
9(2), 169–189. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613800701411731

Jorgensen, E. R. (2015). *Intersecting social justices and music education*. In C. Benedict., P. Schmidt, G. Spruce & P. Woodford (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of social justice and music education*. Oxford University Press. https://scholarworks.iu.edu/dspace/handle/2022/26934

Kertz-Welzel, A. (2016). Daring to question: A philosophical critique of community music. *Philosophy of Music Education Review*, *24*(2), 113–130. https://doi.org/10.2979/philmusieducrevi.24.2.01

Kigozi, B. (2015). *Music education in Uganda. An evaluation of music education in elementary schools in Buganda: A way forward*. https://www.perlego.com/book/3216903/music-education-in-uganda-an-evaluation-of-music-education-in-elementary-schools-in-buganda-a-way-forward-pdf.

Kivunja, C., & Kuyini, A. B. (2017). Understanding and applying research paradigms in educational contexts. *International Journal of Higher Education*, *6*(5), 26–41. https://doi.org/10.5430/ijhe.v6n5p26

Koopman, C. (2007). Community music as music education: On the educational potential of community music. *International Journal of Music Education*, *25*(2), 151–163. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761407079951

Levy, D. L., & Byrd, D. C. (2011). Why can't we be friends? Using music to teach social justice. *Journal of the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning*, *11*(2), 64–75.

Lum, C.-H., & Marsh, K. (2012). *Multiple worlds of childhood: Culture and the classroom*. In G. E. McPherson & G. F. Welch (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music education* (Vol. 1). Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199730810.013.0023

Mack, L. (2010). The philosophical underpinnings of educational research. https://en.apu.ac.jp/rcaps/uploads/fckeditor/publications/polyglossia/Polyglossia_V19_Lindsay.pdf

Madonsela, T. (2020). Social justice transcending inequalities. *Global Governance: A Review of Multilateralism and International Organizations*, *26*(1), 1–20. https://doi.org/10.1163/19426720-02601008

Maree, K. (Ed.). (2016). *First steps in research* (2nd ed.) Van Schaik.

Meier, C., & Hartell, C. (2009). Handling cultural diversity in education in South Africa. *SA-eDUC Journal*, *6*(2), 180–192.

Moen, T. (2006). Reflections on the narrative research approach. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods*, *5*(4), 56–69. https://doi.org/10.1177/160940690600500405

Mouton, R. J., & Morelli, J. (2021). A conceptual framework of the relationship between musicking and personal and social well-being for intermediate phase learners in the South African context. *The Journal for Transdisciplinary Research in Southern Africa*, *17*(1), 8. https://doi.org/10.4102/td.v17i1.1094

North, C. (2008). What is all this talk about "social justice"? Mapping the terrain of education's latest catchphrase. *Teachers College Record*, *110*(6), 1182–1206. https://doi.org/10.1177/016146810811000607

Novak, M. (2000). *Defining social justice. First Things*, 11–12. https://www.firstthings.com/article/2000/12/defining-social-justice

Niland, A. (2017). Singing and playing together: A community music group in an early intervention setting. *International Journal of Community Music*, *10*(3), 273–288. https://doi.org/10.1386/ijcm.10.3.273_1

Odena, O. (2009). *Early music education as a tool for inclusion and respect for diversity.* [Online] https://core.ac.uk/download/pdf/188248558.pdf

Odendaal, A., Kankkunen, O.-T., Nikkanen, H. M., & Vakeva, L. (2014). What's with the K? Exploring the implications of Christopher Small's 'musicking' for general music education. *Music Education Research*, *16*(2), 62–175. https://doi.org/10.1080/14613808.2013.859661

Oehrle, E. (2021). Music education in South Africa. *Visions of Research in Music Education*, *16*(1), 37.

Oellermann, E. (2020). *Exploring the use of music in Foundation Phase teaching.* [Master's Dissertation, University of Pretoria]. https://repository.up.ac.za/bitstream/handle/2263/80498

Otchere, E. D. (2019). Sharing concerns: A direction for African music education. *Music education in Africa.* Routledge. https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429201592-4

Phelan, H. (2008). Practice, ritual and community music: Doing as identity. *International Journal of Community Music*, *1*(2), 143–158. https://doi.org/10.1386/ijcm.1.2.143_1

Presley, E., (1968). If I can dream [Song]. Vevo.

Presley. E., (1972). I've got confidence [Song]. Vevo.

Prest, A. (2020). Cross-cultural understanding: The role of rural school–community music education partnerships. *Research Studies in Music Education*, *42*(2), 208–230. https://doi.org/10.1177/1321103x18804280

Ritchie, J., Lewis, J., Nicholls, C. M., & Ormston, R. (2013). *Qualitative research practice: A guide for social science students and researchers.* SAGE.

Salvador, K., & Kelly-McHale, J. (2017). Music teacher educator perspectives on social justice. *Journal of Research in Music Education*, *65*(1), 6–24. https://doi.org/10.1177/0022429417690340

Silverman, M. (2012). *Community music and social justice: Reclaiming love.* In G. E. McPherson & G. F. Welch (Eds.), *The Oxford handbook of music education* (Vol. 2). Oxford University Press. https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199928019.013.0011

Small, C. (1998b). *Musicking: The meanings of performing and listening.* Wesleyan University Press.

Smith, E. (2018). *Key issues in education and social justice.* (2nd ed.) SAGE.

Swart, I. (2020). Benefits of music education to previously disadvantaged South African learners: Perspectives of music teachers in the greater Tshwane Metropolis. *International Journal of Music Education*, *38*(1), 52–65.

United Nations Scientific and Cultural Organisation (2017). Ensure quality education for all: Sustainable Development Goal 4: 10 targets. https://doi.org/10.1177/0255761419868151

Veblen, K. K., & National Association for Music. (2013). *Community music today.* Rowman & Littlefield Education. http://VH7QX3XE2P.search.serialssolutions.com/?V=1.0&L=VH7QX3XE2P&S=JCs&C=TC0000835105&T=marc&tab=BOOKS

WAR (1975). Why can't we be friends? [Song]. Far out Productions.

World Bank. (2023). *Uganda Overview*. https://www.worldbank.org/en/country/uganda/overview

Yin, R. K. (2016). *Qualitative research from start to finish* (2nd ed.) Guilford Press. https://doi.org/10.1111/fcsr.12144